

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA
HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE

YORK COLLEGE OF PENNSYLVANIA
WEINSTOCK LECTURE HALL
441 COUNTY CLUB ROAD
YORK, PENNSYLVANIA 17403

THURSDAY, JUNE 5, 2014
10:30 A.M.

PUBLIC HEARING
HOUSE BILL 1580 - SCHOOL BUS AUTOMATIC PASSING VIOLATION
DETECTION SYSTEM

BEFORE: HONORABLE JERRY KNOWLES, MAJORITY CHAIRMAN
HONORABLE DAVID HICKERNELL
HONORABLE ADAM HARRIS
HONORABLE MIKE CARROLL, MINORITY CHAIRMAN
HONORABLE MARK LONGIETTI

ALSO PRESENT:
HONORABLE SETH GROVE

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE STAFF PRESENT:

ERIC BUGAILE
MAJORITY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION
COMMITTEE

MEREDITH BIGGICA
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

BETH HORNE-BEACHY
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, COMMERCE COMMITTEE

JUSTIN DURBIN
REPUBLICAN RESEARCH ANALYST

JORDAN GRANT

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I N D E X

PRESENTATION	
By Jillian Meinke	4 - 8
QUESTIONS	8 - 11
PRESENTATION	
By Jeffrey Vermeulen	12
OPENING REMARKS	
By Chairman Knowles	13
OPENING REMARKS	
By Chairman Carroll	14
PRESENTATION	
By Representative Grove	15 - 19
By Blake Krapf	19 - 23
QUESTIONS	23 - 41
DISCUSSION AMONG PARTIES	41 - 46
CONCLUDING REMARKS	
By Chairman Knowles	46 - 47

P R O C E E D I N G S

1
2 -----
3 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: We will have Jillian finish her
4 presentation, and then we'll hear from the other testifiers.
5 So Jillian, if you will.

6 MS. MEINKE: What I want to show you now is sort of
7 the behind the processing of everything that happens once a
8 detection motion is examined from your system. And this is
9 just one application of the different stop arm programs that
10 are out there.

11 So our system utilizes four layers of verification
12 before sending any incident over to police review.

13 BRIEF INTERRUPTION

14 MS. MEINKE: So I'm saying we use four layers of
15 essentially pre-verification before anything is sent to law
16 enforcement for review. So what we just saw there, once the
17 bus activates its red lights, any detection in motion triggers
18 the system for an initial review. That video is streamed via a
19 wireless communications device essentially like your cell
20 phone, for example, wirelessly streamed to our central station
21 monitoring facility in Phoenix, where it is queued up in our
22 initial layer of review, which we refer to as pre-screen. So
23 what you're looking at here, this would be the queue for the
24 day's activity across all buses, telling you that there are 189
25 potential incidents that need to be verified to confirm whether

1 it's a potential violation or whether it could be a false
2 trigger of some sort. Typically, where you would see that is
3 on a divided roadway. If there's a physical barrier and you're
4 passing a vehicle --- passing a school bus on the other side of
5 that barrier, you don't need to stop. That will still set off
6 the motion detection, so it will end up in this queue, but our
7 processors --- our trained processors will weed them out so
8 that it doesn't unnecessarily get to the police for them to
9 look at.

10 When you come into this queue --- go back a little
11 bit here. So when you enter this pre-verification queue, it
12 will bring up the initial video that's captured off the bus.
13 It keeps going a little too far here. There's extra video in
14 here, so I don't want to waste too much of your time with that.

15 Here we go. So this is the initial detection. The
16 arm comes out, motion in the frame is what triggers it to be
17 sent up from the bus in the first place. The monitor will
18 review this video. And because there was a potential, they'll
19 click the accept button, which will bring it to the next stage
20 of processing.

21 When you get into the next stage of processing, we
22 call that our V1 stage, there is a lot of editing that you can
23 do with the images in the video that's detected. The system
24 will capture two stills and it will also prompt anywhere from
25 12 to 24 seconds of video. So you get still images of the

1 vehicle passing the bus, with the arm coming to extension. You
2 get high-resolution images of either the rear or the front
3 license plate, depending upon which direction the vehicle is
4 passing from. And during this initial stage, really all the
5 monitor is looking for is to confirm that all of the images
6 look good and it's something that you would send over to police
7 review. They will also, at this point, zoom in on the license
8 plate and enter that information, where it can be queried
9 against either the MLex database or the state's DMV database to
10 come back with the registered owner's information.

11 So during this stage, once they enter the license
12 plate and the state of registration, their job there is
13 complete, they'll click accept, and it will go into the second
14 stage of processing. This is actually video from the bus in
15 Cornwall, the bus outside. This is the video that's selected.
16 You'll see that it gives you the name of the school district.
17 It gives you the bus number where the violation occurred. It
18 gives you the date and the time of the potential violation. It
19 also gives you the location as GPS coordinates and the
20 direction of the bus' travel. A critical component is this
21 time in red. This tells you how long the red lights were
22 activated when that initial detection in motion was made. So
23 in this violation, the red lights had just been activated when
24 this vehicle triggered the motion detection to send it for
25 further review. So if you scroll up a little bit here ---. So

1 that's the video that the evidence processor saw to say this is
2 something that's worth further police review.

3 So at this point, we'll come back in here, again
4 verify all the data information is correct, and send it through
5 to the V2 stage. Here you can see how they're able to use
6 brightness and contrast control to optimize the image to get a
7 clear, readable license plate. It's a little bit blurry on
8 your screen, but you can see that they're able to get a legible
9 read here to query against that.

10 So at this point, this is the V2 stage. It's the
11 same interface. However, at this point, they have queried the
12 license plate information to come back with the registered
13 owner's details. So during the V2 stage it will actually go to
14 a different processor as a way to verify the integrity of the
15 data. So you get a second set of eyes looking at it to say,
16 yes, I agree that this is a potential violation as it complies
17 with the state statute, and yes, I think that all of the
18 evidence looks appropriate to send along to law enforcement.
19 So here what they're looking for is based on the plate
20 information that came back as a 2012 Jeep, listing the body
21 style as an SUV, it's gray. They're looking at all the
22 information here to confirm that that's accurate. And if they
23 agree that it's accurate, then they will send it through to the
24 final stage of QA, our quality assurance. That's just one last
25 check. Again, it's a third individual. So you have three

1 different processors looking at this before it gets to law
2 enforcement.

3 The law enforcement are able to log in. They are
4 going to see the still images. They will see this zoomed-in
5 plate and then they will see that 20-second violation clip when
6 they are able to make the ultimate determination of, yes, I
7 agree that a violation has occurred and a citation should be
8 mailed, or no, I don't think a violation has occurred, in which
9 case the data is purged and there's no further action taken.
10 Are there any questions on the processing that I can answer?

11 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: Your name, sir, for the
12 stenographer?

13 MR. STAFFORD: It's Joe Stafford, S-T-A-F-F-O-R-D.
14 Your first example is excellent. You had a red signal
15 activated a half a second and the current location had that
16 wide median.

17 MS. MEINKE: Yes.

18 MR. STAFFORD: So the issue always for the public
19 --- and by the way, I'm very much in support of this
20 initiative. How do you not know to stop for a school bus? But
21 I guess the approach that the Committee and the legislature has
22 to consider is having this as a --- what legally would be
23 called a rebuttable defense. So if I were the violator in that
24 picture, it would be very difficult for that oncoming car to
25 see the yellow flashing lights in advance and the red flashing

1 lights. Would that be part of the analysis for law enforcement
2 that would determine, well, that vehicle driver just didn't
3 have a chance or that situation is such a dangerous situation,
4 the next level should be why don't we make that road visible,
5 you know, make a line of sight so that those violations don't
6 occur? It has to be a balance kind of approach. But your
7 technology is excellent. The needs seem redundant, because we
8 already have a statute that says don't pass a school bus. But
9 your numbers are just proving the point that this legislation
10 is needed, if you have that many violations showing up before
11 this goes in place. So my long question was how will that
12 enable law enforcement to determine that the motor-vehicle
13 driver just didn't have a chance to see the stop signs?

14 MS. MEINKE: Sure. That's a great question. So
15 what this technology is intending to do is really be a tool for
16 law enforcement. It is truly a force multiplier. There are
17 480,000 school buses in operation in the country. You cannot
18 have a police officer behind every bus to capture that one
19 violation that statistically is going to occur each day. So
20 what this technology does is it really just extends the eyes
21 and ears of the police so that they're able to review potential
22 incidents that otherwise would have gone detected (sic).

23 The extent of this program, though, is truly
24 predicated on police discretion. We are a third-party
25 administrator to put together the evidence files. When they

1 review this video and they see, okay, this vehicle had half a
2 second of red lights, they also had 150 feet of yellow lights,
3 and at this moment chose to pass the school bus, the video is
4 going to give as much context to the violation as possible.
5 But if the officer reviewing says if I were sitting at that
6 stop and I witnessed that, I wouldn't write a ticket, then they
7 reject it, and there's no further action taken. But if they
8 review it and they say if I was behind that school bus and I
9 saw that vehicle pass and I would have absolutely written that
10 ticket, then they write it. But it really ultimately, at the
11 end of the day, is based on law enforcement, their trained
12 expertise to say what is permissible or not when it comes to
13 passing a bus.

14 MR. STAFFORD: And as a follow-up question, the
15 automatic red light enforcement statutes that we have at
16 intersections doesn't allow forward-facing photos.

17 MS. MEINKE: Yes.

18 MR. STAFFORD: This is going to be forward-facing
19 photos. That's one issue that I think the committee is going
20 to have to deal with. Do you have any input on how that's
21 handled in other states or ---?

22 MS. MEINKE: In all states that are enabling
23 legislation to be passed, you do need to allow for a
24 forward-facing camera, too, so you're able to catch the
25 violators in both directions. What's different about this

1 application versus a red light is the variable nature of the
2 event. You have one camera system, and in some scenarios you
3 have up to six lanes of traffic where a potential violation
4 could occur, as opposed to a red light camera, where it is
5 stationary and you can optimize a camera for each lane, because
6 some states require facial recognition where others don't. So
7 with this application, in order to ensure the best chance of
8 capturing a license plate out of four, five or six lanes,
9 you're really not able to get anything in the vehicle. You
10 sort of have to pick your spot. And the system is optimized to
11 zero in on the license plate and nothing else. So
12 unfortunately, it is --- it's the way that technology works
13 right now, and eliminating that front-facing camera would allow
14 too many violations to go undetected, but I think a concern
15 about, you know, privacy issues and what could possibly be seen
16 in the car ---. Excuse me. As you can see here, you're not
17 able to see anything in that vehicle, and that's typical of
18 what the front-facing camera would capture.

19 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: Okay. Jillian, thank you so
20 much. I would ask the other members to kind of join me up
21 front, if you would. Jillian, thank you so much for that
22 presentation. It's greatly appreciated. And I'm certain that
23 Jillian is going to be around. So if there's any other
24 questions anyone has later, you can certainly talk to her.

25 The first thing I'd like to do is have Jeff

1 Vermeulen of the college here, York College, just say a few
2 words.

3 MR. VERMEULEN: Sure. Thank you, Representative.
4 And thank you to the Subcommittee members for joining us here
5 today. For those of you who it's your first time here in York
6 College, welcome. And those of you who have been here before,
7 welcome back. We've got a few members of our alumni network in
8 the room, namely Representative Grove, who was instrumental in
9 bringing this Subcommittee hearing to campus today. And it's a
10 real honor for the college to be a part of the people's work,
11 so we appreciate you coming by.

12 A little bit about the college, we are a 4,700
13 student college. Roughly 54 majors, is that accurate? Thank
14 you. She's shaking her head yes. We also do provide four
15 Master's degree programs and a recently-added Doctor of Nursing
16 program. We're a comprehensive college. We have engineering
17 and nursing and computer science, which makes a little
18 different than some other institutions.

19 You are in the Weinstock Auditorium, which is part
20 of our newest campus building, which is the Willman Business
21 Center. It's a beautiful building. If you haven't had a
22 chance to take a look around and you're interested in doing so,
23 you can certainly walk around afterward. But again, welcome to
24 York College. Have a great hearing, Seth. And have a great
25 afternoon, everyone. Thank you.

1 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: Thank you very much, Jeff. And
2 it is a gorgeous facility. I say all of these smaller colleges
3 that we have throughout the Commonwealth is truly a jewel ---
4 they're jewels that we can be very proud of.

5 My name is Jerry Knowles. I'm the Representative
6 from the 124th Legislative District. I represent a portion of
7 Berks County, as well as a portion of Schuylkill County.

8 I've been charged by Chairman Micozzie to conduct
9 this hearing today. And I guess --- I'm just reading here ---
10 I am the Chairman --- the Republican Chairman of the
11 Subcommittee on Highway Safety and certainly glad to be doing
12 so. Maybe we'll get to see Chairman Micozzie a little bit
13 later, I'm hoping.

14 But I would like to do --- and on my right here is
15 Representative Mike Carroll. And Mike, we'll ask you to say a
16 few words after the introductions. Mike is the --- is
17 representing the Chair --- the Subcommittee on Highway Safety
18 on the Democratic side.

19 So why don't we start to my left? Representative
20 Hickernell, you want to start off and introduce yourself.

21 REPRESENTATIVE HICKERNELL:

22 Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Good morning, everyone.
23 My name's Dave Hickernell. I represent the 98th District,
24 which is parts of Lancaster and Dauphin Counties. It's a
25 pleasure to be here.

1 REPRESENTATIVE HARRIS: Good morning.

2 Representative Adam Harris. I represent the 82nd District,
3 which is Juniata, Mifflin and Snyder Counties.

4 REPRESENTATIVE LONGIETTI: Good morning.

5 Representative Mark Longietti, the Seventh District, Mercer
6 County.

7 CHAIRMAN CARROLL: Good morning, everyone. I'm Mike
8 Carroll. I represent Luzerne and Monroe Counties, northeastern
9 Pennsylvania. And it's a great pleasure to be here with all of
10 you at York College.

11 Representative McGeehan --- Chairman McGeehan, from
12 Philadelphia, couldn't be here today, so I've been asked to sit
13 in his chair. I'm happy to do so and eager to learn more about
14 a subject that is important.

15 Cameras in 2014 is ubiquitous. The reality is, is
16 that technology is advancing, and it's important that we stay
17 at the forefront to make sure that we advance public safety.
18 So Mr. Chairman, I'm looking forward to the presentation, and
19 we'll go from there.

20 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: Thank you very much, Mike. And
21 thanks to all the members for coming out today. We certainly
22 appreciate you being here. I would ask everyone --- I just did
23 so myself --- to kindly silence your --- whatever they're
24 called, cell phones, iPhones, ePhones, whatever. If you would
25 just silence those so that we won't be interrupted.

1 I think that we'll do is I think we'll --- I think
2 what we'll do, if it's okay with you, Representative Grove, is
3 we will have Blake Krapf, who is the legislative committee
4 chair and the CEO of Krapf Bus Company --- why don't you join
5 Representative Grove up here, if you would, please? And I
6 think what we'll do is, Representative Grove, we will have you
7 speak on the bill, explain the bill. And then we'll hear from
8 Mr. Krapf. And then we'll also be happy to deal with questions
9 from the Committee and then from the public. Representative
10 Grove, proceed when you're ready.

11 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: Thank you. I appreciate the
12 Committee's interest in this bill. Here we are, in beautiful
13 York County, on a Thursday. Obviously, Dave Hickernell is
14 paying a fee to cross the bridge back over to Lancaster on his
15 way out, a running joke between our delegations that work very
16 well together.

17 Obviously, we've just got to see how it works. And
18 I think that the data is alarming that basically every bus is
19 going to have some sort of violation every single day. And
20 what drew my attention to this is at the beginning of every
21 school year, as part of kind of like my weekly e-blast, I
22 always put in a little blurb about school is starting, watch
23 out for school buses. And by the way, here's the actual law,
24 so you know the laws guiding appropriately approaching school
25 buses moving forward.

1 And I was concerned with the feedback I got from
2 that email blast, bus drivers and administrators saying thank
3 you, it happens far too often, and the general public needs to
4 be better educated upon the proper laws, when you can and
5 cannot pass school buses, to the tune of I talked to school bus
6 drivers. Many of them train their students to catch the
7 license plate number of violators, which I think is a very
8 scary proposition, that it happens so frequently, you know,
9 school bus drivers are taking their time, saying, you know, get
10 the plate, get the plate, get the plate. So obviously, I love
11 technology. And some people are scared of cameras every day.
12 Every single one of these has a camera in it. You're not
13 escaping it, no matter where you're at or who you are. The
14 likelihood of you having a camera on you at some point is a
15 reality. I know selfies are a popular thing today, and someone
16 taking a picture of themselves is going to catch you in the
17 background and you're going to end up on the internet whether
18 you like to or not, 24/7. So it's a reality of our society
19 today.

20 But how do we use technology to our advantage?
21 Obviously, in the presentation we're not going to have a law
22 enforcement officer with every school bus every second of the
23 day. Obviously, the school bus driver catches them, they get
24 their plate number. You can follow up with prosecution. If
25 you can't get it, it may not be prosecuted. Even data we've

1 seen of violations over the past few years, a lot of violators
2 end up getting a lower penalty or lower charge or getting
3 dismissed. So actual violators getting charged with this and
4 actually getting the full extent of the law are --- basically
5 the data does not show that it actually happens.

6 What's also scary is York County and Allegheny
7 County, many of our southeast counties have lots of violations
8 moving forward. I do have the data. I forgot to bring it,
9 unfortunately, this morning. I'll make sure the committee gets
10 that data on violators from AOBC. But it's a very, very scary
11 thing, the amount of violators we have. We are very blessed
12 not having incidences. I believe it was yesterday or even this
13 morning that a seven-year-old girl out of Minnesota was almost
14 run over by a big-rig Mack truck, which was caught on one of
15 the cameras that we have a tie-in with the internet. We may be
16 able to bring that video because they actually have it on a
17 webcast sites. You know, luckily, she survived. But again, it
18 was a narrow miss. And you know, obviously, a multi-ton
19 vehicle like that, unfortunately, if it hits a kid, you know,
20 it's the worst-case scenario, which we're trying to, obviously,
21 prevent in this.

22 So a little bit about that. House Bill 1580 sets up
23 a structure or framework for school districts to implement red
24 light cameras. Obviously, in other automated camera processes
25 we have, we have notification. So it does require notification

1 by municipalities and school districts, notification to
2 residents that are going into that local township there will be
3 cameras on buses to capture violations. We do provide payment
4 from the fines to municipalities. Make sure it's an untitled
5 mandate to cover the cost of establishing those signs, which is
6 obviously a very good thing.

7 School districts, obviously, choose to use automated
8 cameras. Obviously, you saw a pilot program out there. I'm
9 not aware of any school district currently that has fully
10 implemented it as far as actually going to prosecution with law
11 enforcement moving forward with that.

12 It does propose a fine of \$250 to crack down on
13 offenders. The actual fine, the vendor's paid through that, as
14 well. So it is the installation and full use. There's no
15 expense to the school district or the bus companies to actually
16 implement this moving forward. So another good cost savings
17 for school districts. So they don't have to pay for it.

18 The money of the fine will be used to cover the
19 costs of implementation and to fund student transportation
20 within the district. If money remains, it will be directed to
21 fund driver education courses for students. Also, the scope
22 there is if you have a better educated student driver who
23 understands the rules of the law, hopefully we won't see future
24 violations moving forward.

25 The citation violation must be mailed to the driver

1 within 60 days of the violation, and drivers have 30 days to
2 appeal the violation after receiving a citation in the mail.
3 Vendor shall file a notice with NAJ, notice of violation,
4 supporting documents in the case of appeal. And the vendor is
5 only to receive compensation under this legislation based on
6 the value of the equipment, not the number of citations issued.
7 So this is not an issue of revenue for anyone. It's truly
8 going after --- trying to catch violators and reduce that
9 moving forward.

10 The school district will work in conjunction with
11 the areas' primary police departments to issue violations under
12 this legislation. Cooperation between the primary police
13 department and the school district will include providing a
14 list to the Department of all provided, approved bus stops. In
15 addition, the district or third-party vendor will provide
16 evidence to see whether or not evidence is sufficient enough to
17 pursue a violation moving forward. We do have defenses built
18 into it, as we did with the red light camera as well, to
19 protect citizens as well moving forward. So that's the overall
20 rundown of House Bill 1580. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

21 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: Thank you very much,
22 Representative Grove. I hope I'm saying it --- is it Mr.
23 Krapf? Is that correct? Am I saying that right?

24 MR. KRAPF: Thank you, Chairman. Thank you for the
25 opportunity to present. It's Krapf (corrects pronunciation.)

1 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: You know what ---?

2 MR. KRAPF: That's quite all right.

3 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: You know what, I got a guy in
4 Tamaqua with the same name. So we'll call you what you want to
5 be called, sir.

6 MR. KRAPF: It's not a problem. It's not a problem.

7 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: I'm sorry. I apologize.

8 MR. KRAPF: It's a commonly mispronounced last name
9 for whatever reason, but --- so again, thank you. I appreciate
10 the opportunity to be here, as we were invited.

11 Just a quick background just so you have a sense of,
12 I guess, maybe why we're here. So I'm president and CEO of the
13 Krapf Bus Company. We're a third-generation family business,
14 entering out 73rd year in business. We operate about 900
15 school buses here in the State of Pennsylvania. We're the
16 largest private school bus company here in the State of
17 Pennsylvania. But really, today I'm here as --- I'm the Chair
18 of the Legislative Committee for the Pennsylvania School Bus
19 Association and president elect. So I'll be president of that
20 association in three weeks. So I'm here to represent the
21 association more than my company today.

22 I guess I would like to start out by saying we
23 support the legislation. You know, obviously, our primary
24 mandate is the safe transportation of students every day. We
25 have a --- as a state and an association, we have a fantastic

1 record here in Pennsylvania. Pennsylvania has really been on
2 the forefront of implementing new technologies, tougher driver
3 standards, whether it be background checks, additional
4 training. We're one of the few states in the country that
5 require recertification training for our drivers. So
6 Pennsylvania has really done an excellent job staying ahead of
7 the curve and doing a fantastic job keeping our schools safe.
8 So we embrace the opportunity to make the bus rides safer.

9 The area around the school bus, outside of the bus,
10 they call that the danger zone because, statistically, that is
11 the most dangerous part of the bus ride for the students, is
12 getting on and off the bus, because of the statistics that
13 Representative Grove mentioned. We have motorists passing our
14 buses every day. It's --- you know, we live it. It's an
15 absolute truth. It does happen every day. And certainly there
16 are areas where you're going to get a much higher volume than
17 others, but it does occur on a daily basis.

18 Just some concerns with --- you know, again, we
19 fully support the legislation. Just, you know, some thoughts
20 that came up today, which in our testimony that we provided, we
21 referenced --- we recommend a pilot program. I was aware that
22 there was a pilot program going on already, but maybe that can
23 be expanded to make sure because it is relatively new
24 technology. You know, we --- some of the questions that came
25 up today, while I was sitting here, listening, you know, we

1 have cameras. Many of you were aware we --- thank you ---
2 recently passed legislation allowing audio to be recorded
3 inside the school bus to help maintain student discipline. So
4 we have a lot of experience with cameras in our buses. But
5 like any mechanical piece of equipment, they fail. So I guess,
6 not sure, you know, how long this technology's been in use, and
7 so it raises the question of who owns the equipment once it's
8 installed by whoever the camera system is, because there's
9 other providers than --- other than the ones we saw today, you
10 know. So is there a monitoring system for when this --- when
11 the camera itself fails, who's responsible to go out and
12 replace it, and all those sorts of things?

13 In our testimony, you see that in Pennsylvania about
14 85 percent of the buses on the road here in Pennsylvania are
15 represented and owned by private contractors, not school
16 districts. Pennsylvania is a very heavily contracted state and
17 the school districts have outsourced their transportation. So
18 most of the time in those situations the private company owns
19 the buses. So obviously, the ownership of the equipment is,
20 you know, an issue. You know, we need to make sure it's being
21 included in the discussion or we'd like to see it included in
22 the discussion and, you know, the durability of the systems and
23 so on and things like that.

24 You know, a couple other things. A lot of it's
25 already been covered. The Representative mentioned that, as

1 the decision would be done locally, we would ask that, again
2 --- and school districts where the buses are owned by private
3 contractors were a part of the selection process. I know, as a
4 company, we work hard to make sure that our vendors meet the
5 same high standards that we set for ourselves. So we --- you
6 know, we want to make sure that if --- we're part of the
7 selection process of selecting the appropriate vendors that
8 come install the cameras.

9 And lastly, I guess maybe a slight variance,
10 because, again, from experience, we have some school districts
11 that have six, seven, eight different townships that make up
12 one school district. Logistically, I think --- as far as
13 enforcing it locally, it might be problematic, and you might
14 consider that it's done by the State Police and that the
15 revenue is collected by the State Police and used by the State
16 Police for driver training, public awareness, things like that.
17 I think it might get complicated for one school district that
18 might have seven different police forces that it works with.

19 So, again, I kind of went through that real quick.
20 We provided, you know, kind of the verbiage backing up our
21 recommendations. And again, I appreciate the opportunity to be
22 here today.

23 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: Thanks. I'm going to play it
24 safe. Thank you, Blake. At this time we will open it up for
25 questions from the members. Representative Carroll?

1 CHAIRMAN CARROLL: Thanks very much. Representative
2 Grove, you're aware that Representative Thomas has a bill and
3 --- that is essentially a pilot program, which I now know is
4 what the Association supports with respect to, you know,
5 efforts to try and test this a little bit in an urban, a rural
6 and a suburban district. Any thoughts on whether or not that
7 step is a smart step in advance of a full-blown execution?

8 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: Obviously, I don't have a
9 particular issue with that. We do have, as you heard, at least
10 one school district running a pilot program for data and so
11 forth. I'll try to get more information to see if that's
12 repeated in other areas. And maybe if we can --- if it's, you
13 know, good data, we see a need for it and how it's working for
14 the school districts, we would bring them in and have further
15 discussions to see how those pilot programs are working.
16 Obviously, we do start out with pilot programs on a consistent
17 basis in the General Assembly for implementing. We did that
18 with the red light cameras starting in Philadelphia with last
19 year's budget time frame. We did do an expansion into that in
20 the City of Philadelphia and a couple of communities outside of
21 it. But you know, I did have conversations with Chairman
22 Thomas and I'm fully supportive of working with him. And
23 obviously, the stakeholders are going to work with us, too.

24 CHAIRMAN CARROLL: And because it's always going to
25 be a question relative to the new program, how does this get

1 paid for? Who's going to pick up the tab for the equipment
2 that will be either on the buses that are owned by your members
3 or by the buses that are owned by the districts?

4 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: So it works the same as the
5 red light cameras in that the vendors will do the installation,
6 and it will be paid for out of the violations. So there's no
7 cost to the bus company. There's no cost to the school
8 districts. And building within there, we can make sure we
9 don't have any unfunded mandates, like within the legislation
10 it calls for municipalities to do notification within their
11 areas of signage to say, you know, school bus cameras are in
12 use in this municipality. They would be --- any cost
13 associated with that would be recovered through that process as
14 well.

15 CHAIRMAN CARROLL: And then finally, any sense of
16 how many of the 500 school districts know of this, are willing
17 to participate, have contemplated it?

18 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: I think because there's no
19 real framework, because we do do notification requirements and
20 cost of implementation, I think this bill addresses --- or
21 tries to address many of those concerns so school districts can
22 move forward with it. Obviously, we have pilot programs with
23 individual school districts going on. None of them are live.
24 It's mostly for data collection and testing the use of
25 equipment moving forward. But I think with --- moving forward

1 with the framework and obviously the --- just for my districts
2 and for pulling statewide data, it is a huge issue, and I think
3 many school districts would look forward to this type of
4 technology to protect our students coming to and from school
5 districts.

6 CHAIRMAN CARROLL: And then my final question is
7 relative to the Lebanon Cornwall School District. Has the
8 photos that have indicated a violation been reviewed by the
9 police in that jurisdiction and is there --- has it taken that
10 step or is it simply a step of the --- sorry.

11 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: I don't know.

12 MS. MEINKE: No.

13 CHAIRMAN CARROLL: Okay. So now, as I understand,
14 it's simply a review by school personnel or the bus company
15 with respect to potential violations. And because I'll suspect
16 Representative Longietti will have questions, and I won't go
17 there, but I would have some additional questions relative to
18 the process. And also you referenced to a driver getting cited
19 and then the reference to the State Police prosecuting. I'm
20 not sure how we get all of that with respect to the photo of a
21 license plate because there's a whole series of questions
22 relative to who we're going to actually cite and how we're
23 going to prosecute these folks. The red light camera in
24 Philadelphia, as you both know, I think, goes about it in a
25 different way. So I'll stop there and let Representative

1 Longietti proceed and fill in the blanks after that, if
2 necessary.

3 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: Representative Longietti. And
4 Mike, we will certainly come back to you. Be glad to do that.

5 CHAIRMAN CARROLL: Thank you.

6 REPRESENTATIVE LONGIETTI: So I haven't had a chance
7 to review your bill, but is there a relationship between the
8 sanction under your legislation and what we already have on the
9 books. How does that all fit together?

10 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: Yeah. We modeled this
11 legislation after the current process. So we look at the data.
12 Basically the entire process is exactly the same. So we build
13 from what's already in the statute into this legislation. But
14 instead of having it as a red light camera, we provide it as a
15 stop light camera for school districts.

16 REPRESENTATIVE LONGIETTI: So is it then a civil
17 penalty that gets assessed to the ---

18 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: Yes.

19 REPRESENTATIVE LONGIETTI: --- registered vehicle
20 owner?

21 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: Yeah.

22 REPRESENTATIVE LONGIETTI: Now, you know, let's say,
23 for example --- I mean, this is a little bit different in the
24 sense of you got a bus driver sitting in a bus. Obviously,
25 they observe the times when people, you know, pass the bus when

1 they shouldn't. Under your legislation, what --- is there
2 anything that prevents, for example, what if the bus driver
3 says, well, I did see the vehicle violate, and then now we have
4 information on the license plate of that vehicle? Is there the
5 potential then for an actual prosecution under the Vehicle Code
6 statutes to say, well, okay, in those --- you know, as you
7 indicated in your testimony, those include license suspensions
8 and fines as well?

9 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: We have actually a two-tier
10 approach. I'm pulling it out here. So the --- if it's just a
11 stop arm camera, it'll be basically a civil arm --- civil ---
12 basically a \$250 fine. In addition, if evidence is provided in
13 further subsection, the school bus operator observes a
14 violation and can provide a signed report and attest to the
15 identity of the driver, the violation shall be made part of the
16 operating record as described under Section 53.05 relating to
17 the schedule of convictions and points. So basically if it's
18 just the camera, you're looking at a civil offense. But if the
19 bus driver can provide a description of the driver and attest
20 to it and back it up, then he can have it fall under the
21 current --- basically prosecution of violating a school bus.

22 REPRESENTATIVE LONGIETTI: So under your
23 legislation, can you have both? In other words, I got a civil
24 penalty. Now, the bus driver also is able to identify the
25 actual vehicle driver, so we're going to go ahead and move

1 forward. We already have the law which carries a fine, I
2 believe, as well as points and a potential license suspension.
3 Can you have both or ---?

4 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: The way the law is drafted,
5 and if we need clarifying language, the scope of it is trying
6 to say you can't have both. It's either you just have the
7 video camera, so it's a civil, \$250 fine. If the school bus
8 driver can verify and attest to the description of the
9 individual, it then warrants the higher penalty, because then
10 you have the camera and you have a physical description of the
11 individual.

12 REPRESENTATIVE LONGIETTI: Is there --- do you know
13 whether or not there's sharing of information? In other words,
14 let's say the bus driver, you know, looks and they say, well, I
15 saw --- you know, I saw a gray Chevy Malibu go by. I could see
16 who the driver was. I didn't get the license plate down. I'm
17 sure that's probably the hardest thing for the bus driver to
18 get? Do they get a chance to look at the video and say, yeah,
19 that was the car, boy, now I can see, you know, this is the
20 license plate, the police are going to get that information?

21 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: Yeah. And nothing in the
22 bill would not allow --- and it would be the local police,
23 obviously. There's some advocacy for the State Police. But
24 however it ends up, there's nothing in the legislation that
25 wouldn't allow the police to go to the bus driver and say was

1 this the car and do you have any further information for me.
2 It would not stop them from doing their normal criminal
3 investigation, processing this. So I would see --- I would not
4 ever imagine that a law enforcement police officer would not
5 follow up with the bus driver and have those conversations.

6 REPRESENTATIVE LONGIETTI: So under your bill, with
7 the review process that we've heard about, ultimately it would
8 go to the local police for them to confirm whether or not, you
9 know, ---

10 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: And then obviously ---.

11 REPRESENTATIVE LONGIETTI: --- a suspension should
12 be applied, and they could follow up and they would have
13 possession of that video to give the bus driver. I guess the
14 only question I have about that is it sounds as though the
15 companies of the cameras are kind of upfronting the cost of the
16 camera systems and then they're going to get that money back on
17 the back end of the citations that are issued. But if we're
18 only issuing citations primarily under existing law, they're
19 not going to get that money. That's going to go to the
20 Commonwealth, I assume.

21 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: It would.

22 REPRESENTATIVE LONGIETTI: Do you know --- and maybe
23 this is an appropriate question for somebody else, but they
24 talked about, you know, the frontal view, the front license
25 plate. We know in Pennsylvania we don't have front license

1 plates. Does that make it complicated, more difficult?

2 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE:

3 I think it does because, obviously, you need --- as
4 the --- whether the car is coming towards you making the
5 violation or coming away from you, you need the front-facing
6 camera. If, for some unknown reason, the person decides to
7 pass you from the rear, maybe it's one of those things where
8 it's a divided highway and you have two lanes on one side and
9 the school bus stop, just kind of fly by, you need that
10 front-facing camera to get that rear license plate.

11 The other aspect is, oncoming traffic, you need to
12 show some arm open and that that individual violated. I think
13 clearly it shows the camera --- you couldn't even see who was
14 driving that vehicle. I mean, that's going to be something
15 that that individual bus driver or another witness on that bus
16 is going to have to say, yes, I saw a gentleman with white hair
17 and glasses, gray suite, red tie, very nice House of
18 Representatives pin, coming the other way. So it --- you know,
19 I know personal privacy is a big issue. I didn't see anything
20 in the technology that we have that's really going to highlight
21 that oncoming person in there, but you do need, unfortunately,
22 two-sided cameras to pick up the entire violation and make
23 sure, obviously, we're doing a good job and doing this to make
24 sure it's effective and protecting the individuals as well. If
25 you only have a half-shown person going away from you, you

1 don't see at the starting point moving forward.

2 REPRESENTATIVE LONGIETTI: Last question. The
3 notification portions of your bill, are those street signs ---
4 what would the notice ---?

5 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: So it would have to put up a
6 notice --- funny story about my time here at York College. I
7 had a good friend of mine. She was from Minnesota. And I had
8 explained local government to her, because they had county
9 government. And you know, her explanation is, my God, I drive
10 five feet and I'm in a different entity, because most of our
11 townships have those welcome to York City, welcome to whatever
12 townships. Now, some municipalities don't have that, but it
13 would be a requirement of the municipality to put some signage
14 on their borders, on the street ways to clarify be aware that
15 school bus cameras are in use in these areas, and part of this
16 is to reimburse the local governments for those costs, make
17 sure it's not an undue burden to them. So it would be a grant
18 process where they could do that.

19 REPRESENTATIVE LONGIETTI: Is that --- under your
20 bill, is it for major thoroughfares? I'm thinking of a couple
21 communities in my area where, you know, a side street --- you
22 go down a side street, and then you're in the next community.

23 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: That's something that
24 probably needs clarified in there because we just, I think,
25 have a general provision.

1 REPRESENTATIVE LONGIETTI: Thank you.

2 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: Thank you, Representative
3 Longietti. We appreciate your questions. Representative
4 Grove, I guess we were all provided information, multiple data
5 from our districts in terms of violations. And I guess --- I'm
6 kind of shocked at how few violations that there are in
7 particularly my community. I guess I would think that this is
8 something that a bus driver would --- like this is more
9 probably --- what is the reason? Does it have to do with the
10 inability to get the information to prosecute or identify the
11 driver? You know, what problems do you see with bus drivers in
12 times of currently prosecuting.

13 MR. KRAPF: Well, I think --- this is a good
14 question. You know, there's a couple problems, I think, that
15 happen practically. One --- so your driver --- your school bus
16 driver under the current enforcement is required to get license
17 plate number and description. Meanwhile, they're also supposed
18 to be safely operating a 72-passenger bus with 70 children
19 behind them. It's a lot to capture in a split second. So
20 they're trained --- you know, they're trained to watch for
21 traffic, make sure they don't open the door until traffic is
22 stopped and all those things. But once they open the door, if
23 someone decides to go, they're also trained to count students
24 as they go off the bus so that they know that all the students
25 have reached a place of safety before they pull away. So it's

1 just a lot, you know, currently for a driver to capture all of
2 that. And you know, I think Representative Grove mentioned
3 where he's talked to bus drivers that they actually taught
4 their children on the bus to capture the license plate numbers.
5 And that is, indeed, our drivers do ask their students to try
6 and be on the lookout for it. So it's --- first of all, I
7 think it's difficult for them to capture the appropriate
8 information. I think there is a challenge, and I don't --- I'm
9 not necessarily against the current penalties, but I think ---
10 and I can tell you --- I can tell you a story that I just
11 experienced. So a friend of mine, his daughter got --- she got
12 pulled over for running the red lights, got a citation. And of
13 course, he said, well, you know, is there anything I can do
14 about it. I said, no, absolutely not, there's nothing I can do
15 about it. So she had her day in court last week. And the
16 judge reduced it to a lower offense because there was a gray
17 area in the testimony, and they reduced it to a lower offense.
18 So I think because the penalties are strict, sometimes there
19 may be --- there might be a tendency to plead to a lower
20 offense in order to get the violation. So you know --- but
21 there are --- there are other --- you know, there are some
22 national --- they call it operation safe software where there
23 are different times where police officers will ride the buses
24 and capture the data or follow certain buses and try to
25 actually capture realtime data. But if your local police

1 departments or school districts don't participate in those
2 programs, then they're not capturing the data. So you may not
3 be getting accurate data as well. So I don't know if I
4 answered your question, but I think there's a multitude of
5 problems.

6 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: Do you --- in terms of --- in
7 terms of the police prosecuting, when you've approached police
8 departments in order to bring charges, how much detailed
9 information do they require? Do they require the make of the
10 --- the color of the car, the make of the car, registration
11 number? Do you have to clearly identify the operator of the
12 vehicle?

13 MR. KRAPF: By description, yes. And it's not ---
14 as a --- as the company, we are not the ones actually bringing
15 forth the charge. It's the bus driver. So the bus driver has
16 to take the initiative to write down the description of the
17 driver, the description of the car and the license plate number
18 and then call it into the police, if the officer isn't there
19 and actually witnesses it. So it's really the driver in
20 conjunction with the police department that are bringing the
21 charge against the driver.

22 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: Thank you very much.
23 Representative Carroll? Did you have something?

24 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: Just to make a point. Does
25 anybody remember the plate number of the car out front? Bus

1 drivers have to. I mean, even, you know, it's silver. You
2 know, I forget the make of it, but I mean, the bus driver has
3 to not only look around and make sure the kids are safe,
4 dealing with, you know, how many, 60 kids in the back of the
5 bus, ---

6 MR. KRAPF: Up to 70.

7 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: --- up to 70 sometimes, and
8 then, you know, try to turn around and catch all that
9 information at one time. It is a lot, and it puts a lot on
10 those bus drivers.

11 MR. KRAPF: Actually, one other thing. When we're
12 talking about the cameras facing both directions, right now
13 we're just talking about a camera on the left side of the
14 school bus. I can tell you where there are situations
15 regularly where we have cars passing on the right side of the
16 bus, if you can believe that. So you have cars that will come
17 down the shoulder of the street and pass a bus with its red
18 lights flashing. It happens. It happens. So not ---
19 thankfully, not as frequently, but it does happen.

20 CHAIRMAN CARROLL: Representative Grove, we didn't
21 memorize the license because we knew there were cameras
22 involved. So that obligation expired as a result of the
23 knowledge of the cameras. But the statistic that I've heard a
24 couple times so far today is one violation per bus per day.
25 Does that reconcile with what your experience is in the world

1 of school buses in Pennsylvania?

2 MR. KRAPF: I believe that is a national statistic,
3 but I --- our experience --- so we --- you know, I mentioned
4 where, you know, we operate about 900 school buses here in the
5 state. I can tell you in the more, you know, urban and
6 suburban districts, where --- you know, we operate a lot of
7 buses in Chester County. It's a larger issue in some of those
8 areas than in the more rural areas, but not that it doesn't
9 happen in the rural areas. But it varies from --- it's really
10 kind of a local --- the frequency is higher in some locations
11 than others.

12 CHAIRMAN CARROLL: Certainly.

13 MR. KRAPF: But I believe that was a national
14 average. But I believe it to be fairly accurate.

15 CHAIRMAN CARROLL: And when I reconciled that with
16 the statistics I was provided with respect to convictions for,
17 you know, illegally passing a school bus, there's a real
18 disparity there. And so I have to figure that that delta is
19 that the target here is an effort to try and get the attention
20 of folks and make sure that they don't pass the school bus.

21 In your opinion, is the number of convictions, as to
22 what Representative Knowles is talking about, is a function of
23 the inability for the driver of the bus to be able to secure
24 the necessary information to get the conviction or take the
25 case to a magistrate, or is it a case of just simply the

1 inconvenience of the steps that would be necessary with respect
2 to appearing at a magistrate's office for a trial, all that
3 goes along with that? The likelihood is your bus driver,
4 statistically --- I'll ask that question. Does the bus driver
5 have to go to the magistrate for the hearing?

6 MR. KRAPF: Yes. Yes, they do.

7 CHAIRMAN CARROLL: All right. So now you have the
8 inconvenience of a bus driver who may not be able to operate
9 the bus because he or she has to attend a hearing. I just
10 wonder if, you know, that the number of convictions is so small
11 because of the inability or because of the inconvenience.

12 MR. KRAPF: I think it's the inability because most
13 school bus drivers take their job very serious. They regard
14 those children --- if you actually --- you know, if you come
15 into one of our parking lots and you talk to the drivers, they
16 talk about those kids on the bus as their children. And most
17 drivers stay on the same bus route from year to year to year,
18 so they're not --- I can tell you I have four children and I
19 have had one bus driver. You know, we've had the same bus
20 driver since my children started going to school. So I mean,
21 they know that bus driver better than their teacher, because
22 they've had the same driver for multiple years in a row. And
23 that's --- that is fairly common. That's the norm, generally.
24 So they get --- the drivers get very close with the children,
25 become very protective of the children. So they --- you know,

1 they --- if they can do something to add to the safety of the
2 children, they're all for it. I think it's really --- the
3 difficulty ---.

4 I believe this technology is being used in other
5 states. I mean, maybe the manufacturers of the systems would
6 be able to provide data that shows a change in pattern. I
7 don't know if it's been in use long enough. I can't speak
8 intelligently as to what states it's being used, but maybe
9 there's existing data that could show whether it did change
10 behavior.

11 CHAIRMAN CARROLL: And another question for you, for
12 the folks with technology, you know, as I watched the video I
13 was wondering does the video record and let us know or let the
14 law enforcement folks know how long the flashing yellow lights
15 have been on? And I see nodding heads, so I take that as a
16 yes.

17 And then the other thing is the distances that are
18 involved. You know, at an intersection in Philadelphia, you
19 have lines that would designate the intersection and you have
20 it seems to me a fair chance to determine distances. The
21 example that I saw up there with the half a second of the ---
22 you know, through the stop arm, you know, my calculation there
23 is that that would be --- probably fall in the category of a
24 tough one to bring a citation. If I were the driver of that
25 vehicle, my default would probably be, well, how would I be

1 expected to stop in half a second, I'm not sure the yellow
2 lights were on as long as they were. So I guess, for me, I'd
3 have a few more questions about the technology. Nothing that
4 you can answer.

5 MS. KRAPF: I think you bring up a highlighted
6 question because that one's a tough one because you have a row
7 of trees and a median looking straight ahead. So I think it's
8 --- it reflects the technology, and I would say, you know, it's
9 the call of the police officer to charging. And then I would
10 say that driver has probably a pretty good defense, going to a
11 court of law to say, you know, look at the scenario and the
12 situation. I had a row of trees. He may not have seen it.
13 But again, I think we would have further conversation with
14 technology.

15 CHAIRMAN CARROLL: I guess my fault, again, I'd
16 prefer if it were --- you know, not to bring it in the first
17 place so we don't have to have folks contest these. To the
18 extent that we can limit that, I suppose I'd be for that.

19 Again, from my perspective, you know, technology is
20 something that should be our tool with respect to enforcement
21 of the laws of the Commonwealth. And to the extent that we get
22 there, I'd be supportive of that. So I'll stop there.

23 MR. KRAPF: I do have some statewide data to share.
24 I'll make sure everybody gets a copy of this. But here's total
25 violations in Section 3345, overtaking a school bus. So down

1 here in 2008 you see 358 violations. In 2013, we're at 2,113
2 violations for the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. So we see a
3 drastic increase over the past few years. From January 28th
4 --- this data is provided from AOPC. January 28th to December
5 13th, top violators, Allegheny County, 1,970; Montgomery,
6 1,066; Bucks County, 762; Delaware, 650; Chester, 558; Lehigh,
7 351; Erie, 339; Dauphin, 324; York, 324; Berks County, 294. So
8 you can see the top 20 counties by violators.

9 CHAIRMAN CARROLL: Are those violations or
10 convictions?

11 MR. KRAPF: These are violations, so --- then we go
12 into convictions. You see here, guilty pleas are at 2,108.
13 Guilty, 1,601. Withdrawn, 555. Not guilty, 752. Charge
14 changed, 2,826. Guilty of a lesser charge, 1,295. And then
15 dismissed, 346. So as you can see flowing through this, what
16 district magistrates are doing at the local level are either
17 changing the charge or giving a lesser charge versus applying
18 the full level of a violation. And unfortunately, male drivers
19 are worse than female drivers because there is about 4,865 male
20 violators and 4,099 female violators, so ---. I'll make sure
21 everyone gets a copy of this as well.

22 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: Thanks very much. I'd just like
23 to briefly recognize the staff members who are with us. First
24 of all, Eric Bugaile, who is the Majority Executive Director of
25 the Transportation Committee. And there are staff people here

1 on behalf of members. Meredith Biggica --- how'd I do?

2 MS. BIGGICA: Great.

3 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: All right. And you are from
4 Representative Dean's office; as well as Beth Horne Beachy from
5 Representative Curt Thomas' office; Justin Durbin, from
6 Representative Micozzie's office; and Jordan Grant from
7 Representative Grove's office. So we thank you, staff, for the
8 time that you do. We appreciate that. Further questions?

9 Okay. We're going to --- we're going to open it up
10 for public comment. Any questions from the public? I would
11 ask you to stand, very clearly identify yourselves. We do have
12 a stenographer here, and we want to be certain that she gets
13 each and every word that we need. So at this time, is there
14 anyone from the public that may have any questions or comments?
15 Your name, sir?

16 MR. STAFFORD: Joe Stafford. Thanks to
17 Representative Grove for outlining his bill. I may have not
18 have the full text of the bill. My question would be two.
19 Comparing and contrasting the automatic red light enforcement
20 statute that we have now for signalized intersections, is that
21 administered by, you know, law enforcement? It started with
22 Philadelphia Parking Authority, not intuitively obvious, but
23 that's how it works. They have certified law enforcement
24 reviewing the video --- in that case, it's still video, but now
25 we're going to have actual video. How would this bill be

1 enacted so that the law enforcement utilized to review the
2 video is trained or --- to assure the public that the review of
3 the video will take place in a managed way? I don't know if
4 that's addressed in the bill. And I was a little confused by
5 the option of a civil fine versus the criminal fine. I mean,
6 if it's going to be in Title 75, in my opinion, as a member of
7 the public, I think the same violation should apply, the high
8 fine, the five points and everything that applies. I don't
9 know where that civil penalty would be permitted. That's my
10 question.

11 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: I'll hit on the fine aspect
12 because the other question would go back to implementation, and
13 we set structure, not implementation of it. Basically what
14 we're looking at is, under current scenarios, a bus driver sees
15 a person, gets a plate number, has to attest to the individual.
16 With the technology we're utilizing, obviously, if the bus
17 driver can attest to it, the video feed would back that up as
18 far as verifying the vehicle and the make of it.

19 I don't think we want individuals charged under the
20 current law with just a video feed because you're not verifying
21 the actual individual because of privacy. That's the
22 distinguishing factor between the two. So I believe it's a
23 60-day suspension of your license, a 60 or 90-day suspension,
24 high fine --- I mean, it is a huge penalty just to go off the
25 make of a vehicle and, in all reality, I mean, it could be your

1 child driving it. That's why it's a civil versus the actual.
2 Now, if we can get verification with the bus driver of the
3 individual that we know is, indeed, you and not your kid, your
4 wife, somebody along those lines, driving it ---.

5 CHAIRMAN CARROLL: The only thing I'll add is that
6 vehicles are jointly owned. Vehicles are leased. You have a
7 whole series of ownership situations when it comes to vehicles.
8 So the civil option really is the only choice because, absent
9 the identification of the driver, who are you going to charge
10 if you and I jointly own the vehicle? And so the ownership of
11 a vehicle situation gets complicated with respect to just
12 assigning a citation for a significant penalty in the Vehicle
13 Code when there are all sorts of vehicle ownership situations,
14 as I said. So that makes it --- that really was the issue that
15 confronted the folks with the red light camera proposition, and
16 that's why they ended up with the parking ticket style penalty
17 and the Philadelphia Parking Authority.

18 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: Thank you very much, Mike. Is
19 there anyone else with questions? Yes, sir. Your name,
20 please?

21 MR. O'SHELL: Don O'Shell, O-S-H-E-L-L. And I serve
22 as the York County Clerk of Courts here in York County. This
23 question, from the courts' perspective, a lot of times, at
24 least early on with video evidence, sometimes the systems are
25 proprietary. And as they move up from the District Court to

1 the Common Pleas Court, it's difficult for prosecutors to play
2 those for the court. I just wanted to get sense from the
3 vendors community that this evidence can be played on pretty
4 much any PC or laptop, so that it's not difficult to view in
5 court.

6 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: Jillian?

7 MS. MEINKE: Our's is a web-based system. So as
8 long as you have access to the internet and it's a standard MP4
9 file, you can play it through our system.

10 MR. O'SHELL: And I saw that there was some ---.

11 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: Excuse me one minute. Are you
12 catching ---?

13 COURT REPORTER: Yes.

14 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: Okay. I'm sorry. Go ahead, sir.

15 MR. O'SHELL: There is some discussion in the bill
16 in terms of how long the vendor maintains the evidence once the
17 case has been disposed. There's no reference to how long the
18 courts hold onto evidence that's been admitted by the
19 prosecution. And typically, our standpoint is, once appeals
20 have been exhausted or the time frame has been expended, then
21 we go ahead and push the court for instruction. I don't know
22 if the bill intends to address that at some point.

23 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: Representative Grove?

24 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: I'm always happy to make you
25 happy. I'm always happy to make you happy, Buddy.

1 MR. O'SHELL: Thank you.

2 REPRESENTATIVE GROVE: You're welcome.

3 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: Thank you, sir, for your question
4 --- for your comments. Anyone else have a question? Anyone
5 else have a question? Anyone else have a question, going for
6 the third and final time?

7 Okay. The members --- first of all, our two
8 panelists, would either of you --- anything you'd like to
9 enter?

10 MR. KRAPF: I just appreciate the Committee's
11 interest in this. Obviously, school days are done, so we
12 shouldn't have any violations this summer. But in a couple of
13 months school will start up, so we will continue moving on this
14 for a piece of legislation. And I'll be more than happy to
15 take Jeff up on the offer to take a tour of the campus here.
16 They have an awesome NASDAQ program, where they're linked in
17 directly to Wall Street for training students. So I want to
18 check it out, and maybe we can slide down to the fourth floor.
19 Maybe?

20 MR. VERMEULEN: Maybe.

21 MR. KRAPF: Maybe. Beautiful view. But again, I
22 appreciate the Committee's willingness to take this on and your
23 travel down to York. And I appreciate the stakeholders'
24 comments.

25 CHAIRMAN KNOWLES: Any members, closing comments?

1 Okay. I would just say that I appreciate --- Representative
2 Grove and I have had some conversations on this legislation,
3 and I'm coming into this with an open mind. I still have some
4 serious questions and concerns that I think we will address
5 along the way. We certainly all recognize the serious problem
6 in dealing with our young people and dealing with school buses.
7 And I have a sister that drives a school bus, and it takes a
8 certain kind of person to do that. And I mean that sincerely.
9 So having said that, I thank you all for coming out. I thank
10 the college. I commend you on this gorgeous facility. And
11 everyone be safe in going home and enjoy the rest of your day.
12 Thank you.

13 HEARING ADJOURNED AT 11:45 A.M.
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter, that the foregoing proceedings were taken stenographically by me, and thereafter reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability.


Cynthia Ann Simpson
Court Reporter