1	
2	COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA
3	HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES APPROPRIATIONS COMMITTEE
4	MAIN CAPITOL
5	ROOM 140
6	HARRISBURG, PENNSYLVANIA
7	BUDGET HEARING
8	CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION
9	MONDAY, FEBRUARY 26, 2018 1:09 P.M.
10	
11	BEFORE:
12	
13	HONORABLE STANLEY SAYLOR, MAJORITY CHAIRMAN HONORABLE JOSEPH MARKOSEK, MINORITY CHAIRMAN HONORABLE KAREN BOBACK
14	HONORABLE SHERYL DELOZIER HONORABLE GEORGE DUNBAR
15	HONORABLE GARTH EVERETT HONORABLE KEITH GREINER
16	HONORABLE MARCIA HAHN
17	HONORABLE DOYLE HEFFLEY HONORABLE SUE HELM
18	HONORABLE LEE JAMES HONORABLE WARREN KAMPF
19	HONORABLE FRED KELLER HONORABLE DUANE MILNE
20	HONORABLE JASON ORTITAY HONORABLE MIKE PEIFER
21	HONORABLE MARGUERITE QUINN HONORABLE BRAD ROAE
22	HONORABLE JAMIE SANTORA HONORABLE CURT SONNEY
23	HONORABLE KEVIN BOYLE HONORABLE TIM BRIGGS
24	HOHOLIADII III DILIGOO
25	
J	

```
1
     BEFORE (continued):
     HONORABLE DONNA BULLOCK
     HONORABLE MADELEINE DEAN
3
     HONORABLE MARIA DONATUCCI
     HONORABLE MARTY FLYNN
4
     HONORABLE PATTY KIM
     HONORABLE STEPHEN KINSEY
 5
     HONORABLE LEANNE KRUEGER-BRANEKY
     HONORABLE MIKE O'BRIEN
     HONORABLE MARK ROZZI
 6
     HONORABLE PETER SCHWEYER
7
     NON-COMMITTEE MEMBERS:
8
     HONORABLE MARTY CAUSER
     HONORABLE RUSS DIAMOND
     HONORABLE KATE HARPER
9
     HONORABLE MARK KELLER
10
     HONORABLE DAVE MILLARD
     HONORABLE TOMMY STANKEY
11
     HONORABLE WILL TALLMAN
     HONORABLE MIKE TOBASH
12
     HONORABLE DAVE ZIMMERMAN
     HONORABLE MIKE CARROLL
13
     HONORABLE CAROLYN COMITTA
     HONORABLE MARK LONGIETTI
14
     HONORABLE STEVE MCCARTER
     HONORABLE ED NEILSON
     HONORABLE EDDIE PASHINSKI
15
     HONORABLE GREG VITALI
16
     HONORABLE PERRY WARREN
17
     COMMITTEE STAFF PRESENT:
     DAVID DONLEY, MAJORITY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
18
     RITCHIE LaFAVER, MAJORITY DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
    MIRIAM FOX, MINORITY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
     TARA TREES, MINORITY CHIEF COUNSEL
19
20
21
                     BRENDA J. PARDUN, RPR
                         P. O. BOX 278
22
                       MAYTOWN, PA 17550
                         717-940-6528
23
24
25
```

1	INDEX	
2	NAME	PAGE
3	DR. STEPHANIE SHANBLATT CHAIR	7
4	PA COMMISSION FOR COMMUNITY COLLEGES	
5	JACQUELINE CULLEN EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR	13
6	PA ASSOCIATION OF CAREER & TECHNICAL ADMINISTRATORS	
7 8	DR. MARTIN HUDACS SUPERINTENDENT OF RECORDS LANCASTER COUNTY CAREER & TECHNOLOGY CENTER	15
9 L0	DR. WILLIAM E. GRISCOM	21
LO L1	PRESIDENT THADDEUS STEVENS COLLEGE OF TECHNOLOGY	21
L1 L2	THADDEOS STEVENS COLLEGE OF TECHNOLOGI	
L3		
L 4		
L 5		
L 6		
L7		
L 8		
L9		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

## PROCEEDINGS

MAJORITY CHAIRMAN SAYLOR: We'll call the hearing to order. And right away, I want to apologize. I have to leave for another meeting, but I hopefully will be back before it's all done and said.

I want to thank everybody for being here. If you would all rise and raise your right hand and repeat after me.

WILLIAM E. GRISCOM,

MARTIN HUDACS,

JACQUELINE CULLEN,

STEPHANIE SHANBLATT,

each having been duly sworn or affirmed, testified on his or her oath as follows, to wit:

MAJORITY CHAIRMAN SAYLOR: This is our first hearing of the afternoon. And, of course, we're focusing on career and technical education. In the governor's budget address, he included a large increase to support apprenticeships and career education. And I'm glad the governor is joining us in this call and how important it is to recognize the value of a career and technical education and the vital role it plays in particularly our Pennsylvania

growing economy and across our nation.

Before us today we have the

Pennsylvania Association of Career and Technical

Administrators, the community college

association, the Lancaster County Career and

Technical -- Technology Center, excuse me, and

Thaddeus Stevens College of Technology. Each of our panelists have key insights into how our strengths and how to grow our career and technical opportunities in the commonwealth.

This hearing is being held to dive into areas where we can support job creation in our budget. We constantly hear about the shortage of qualified workers to meet the needs here in Pennsylvania. And if truly we want to grow our economy, we must invest in the skilled workforce.

So, with that, I'm going to turn this over to Vice Chairman George Dunbar.

Representative Dunbar will be here. And Chairman Markosek is not here, and his vice chairman of the committee, Mr. Briggs,

Representative Briggs, is here as well.

So, with that, we will start off with the first questioner, Representative Hahn.

REPRESENTATIVE HAHN: Thank you Chairman.

I'm over here. Thank you for attending.

I'm very supportive of the vocational technical schools. I think they're a great program and like to see them funded as much as possible, as well as community colleges. So, I guess, I'm going to shift to the community colleges first to ask my question.

The budget request by the community colleges sent to the Department of Education requested additional funds for operating -- for the operating expense but level funding for their capital expense. But the governor's budget proposal included nearly 50.7 million for the transfer to the community colleges capital fund. So, that's an increase of 1.8 million, which then has to be divide between the fourteen community colleges. So, that's not giving them much of an increase.

But do you know why the additional funds were allocated for capital? And can you explain how this capital money is used and what the impact -- and what impact it has on the

community colleges?

DR. SHANBLATT: Sure. I can explain how the capital money is used every year. The colleges submit proposals to the Pennsylvania Department of Education. Those proposals are scored and ranked and funded until the money runs out. Now, you realize, of that, say, 47, 48 million dollars, a large portion of it is already obligated to prior loans and debt service. So, we don't actually get 48 million dollars in new money every year.

So, if I have a twenty-year bond and they're paying in year ten of it, that's coming out of that. So, there's typically a couple million dollars a year available for new projects and for whatever the cost of loans or bonds for those new projects would be.

So, the colleges basically compete based on a priority order in terms of mainly how it impacts students the most. Those score the highest, and we go from there. It's never quite enough. But, in all honesty, our operating needs are much greater than our capital needs. And so, we requested 10 million dollars in operating, didn't getting anything; requested a

zero increase in capital, and I'm not sure how that happened. You know, we've been flat for three years on operating. So, we have some work to do there.

REPRESENTATIVE HAHN: So, the increase in capital would allow you to have more projects, but you really need the increase in the operational. That would be more beneficial.

particularly on the workforce side. And it's hard to do that without any new money, because those programs, frankly, are a little more expensive than some of our transfer programs to both start up and to continue running.

REPRESENTATIVE HAHN: So, in my area, when the casinos came in, I know the community college was right on the ball in getting classes together for whatever positions, dealers, whatever they needed at the casinos.

So, that would come out of your operating cost

	9
1	to set that up. So, any time you need a new
2	program, it's coming from your operating, not
3	your capital. So, it would just seem like you
4	would need be better off to have more money
5	in your operational.
6	DR. SHANBLATT: I agree.
7	REPRESENTATIVE HAHN: Okay. Good.
8	Well, thank you.
9	Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
10	REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: Thank you.
11	Next will be Acting Chairman Briggs.
12	REPRESENTATIVE BRIGGS: Thank you,
13	Chairman.
14	I'm going to try to get my
15	questioning, because when the full chairman
16	comes, I'm going to be kicked out of his chair,
17	so I'll try that I'll try to be quick.
18	But I have a special place in my
19	heart for community colleges, as I attended
20	Montgomery County Community College for my
21	freshman year of college, and it was a terrific
22	experience, and every credit I had transferred.
23	I have two high school students now,
24	and Upper Marion Area High School has a dual

enrollment program that they are expanding.

Could you talk a little bit about the dual 1 enrollment, and then also how articulation 2 agreements and if there are challenges in --3 with them, with certain schools? 4 DR. SHANBLATT: Articulation from 5 high school to college or community college to 6 7 transferring to a four-year? 8 REPRESENTATIVE BRIGGS: Transfer to 9 a four-year. 10 DR. SHANBLATT: Okay. So, first of 11 all, regarding dual enrollment, all fourteen 12 community colleges do lots of dual enrollment. 13 The challenge for us, in all honesty, is that there are no state dollars for dual enrollments, 14 15 so students have to pay for that. Their 16 families have to pay for that, as you probably 17 know. And that creates somewhat of a tiered opportunity and an access issue for high school 18 19 students. 20 We have -- some colleges use the 21 EITC dollars to help with dual enrollment. 22

We have -- some colleges use the EITC dollars to help with dual enrollment.

Overall, we do lots and lots with dual enrollment. We know we can help those students to take the right courses so they will be accepted not just by our colleges but by

23

24

1 four-years as well. 2 So, while we have robust programs, there are some serious access issues because 3 4 there are no state dollars for dual enrollment. 5 So, that's that piece. Regarding articulation agreements, I 6 7 think -- yeah, go ahead. 8 REPRESENTATIVE BRIGGS: I'm going to 9 interrupt. Did that change? I mean, I got 10 elected in 2008. 11 DR. SHANBLATT: Yes. 12 REPRESENTATIVE BRIGGS: And I feel 2009, 2010, that was a program that was funded. 13 And -- and there was --14 DR. SHANBLATT: And then it wasn't. 15 16 REPRESENTATIVE BRIGGS: Got 17 unfunded. Right. 18 DR. SHANBLATT: Yes, so it did 19 change. Yes. Yes. 20 And it's been a real challenge for 21 us to try to help the students who we believe 22 actually need it the most, students from lower socioeconomic status, to get them to feel that 23 24 they're ready for college, that they can go to

college, they are college material, and yet

their families oftentimes can't afford it. So, yes, it's a huge challenge for us.

And it helps them even on the career and technical side as well, because we have pathways from there where we're doing dual enrollment at our career and technical schools, at least in Bucks County.

Does that help?

REPRESENTATIVE BRIGGS: Yeah.

DR. SHANBLATT: Okay. Do you want

me to --

REPRESENTATIVE BRIGGS: I was more curious that, and then let's say a senior, or me, as a freshman, what's the success rate of transferring the credits they earn to a four-year school? And is it -- is there agreements to that with schools? I know that Montgomery County Community College has done a great job with Penn and St. Joe's and Temple and all -- Lehigh, all the schools. Is that typical for community colleges?

DR. SHANBLATT: Yes. Yes. I can certainly speak well about Bucks. I know all the other thirteen colleges have articulation agreements as well. We work very hard with our

four-year partners, both public and private, because there are so many privates that students want to attend.

If students listen to us and take the courses we tell them to take, they will transfer. Occasionally, a student decides they want to take something that doesn't transfer, and we can't really help that or fix that. But if they follow the program and the articulation guide, all of those courses will transfer.

We have great -- great four-year partners. And we work very well together. I don't think that part is not working.

REPRESENTATIVE BRIGGS: Great, great.

I am going to transfer over to career and technology centers a little bit. My understanding of them is you're great -- well situated to address local business needs and commerce and to grow. Are you -- I'm sure, as funding, if an opportunity comes to provide training and the funding's not there, how do you address that?

MS. CULLEN: The funding generally for career and technical education adult --

REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: Excuse me.

Can you pull the microphone back so -- thank you.

MS. CULLEN: For adult programs at career and technical education centers, there is some state funding. It's minimal. It's 688 per instructional hour. So, that means, if the teacher is teaching one hundred hours, the state is providing 6,880 dollars. Our average teacher salaries in most of the CTCs adult programs are over 25 dollars an hour. It really doesn't address the equipment, the supplies.

So, our schools have become very aggressive in advertising and in working with business and industry. They view themselves, on the adult side, as their job is workforce development. Examples might be, right now, megatronics is very big. It's a very expensive program. But businesses are looking for people trained in that, so our schools are responding either by customized job training efforts with businesses where they go into the business and train the employers -- train the employees, upgrade their skills, or they do a program that will lead to certification.

But the -- on the adult side,
everything has to be self-supported. So, they
have to either go to business and industry for
money or to provide a cost per student, and the
student pays, if a company's not paying.

But the adult programs are growing, especially in the areas where jobs are growing, such as manufacturing, health occupations, and others.

DR. HUDACS: And if I could take a look at that from the secondary perspective, because Lancaster career center is both secondary and then we have the adult ed as well.

On the secondary level, we do get some state funding through the competitive grant, but we rely mostly on the funding that would come through the sixteen school districts that are contributing. So, while this is career and technical, anything that impacts the money going to them impacts the money coming to the CTCs in passthrough.

In addition, EIT, as a -- with the foundation that we have, EIT is a tremendous support as well, offering those tax credits to manufacturers and industry that are able to

1 support the programs. And we have a pretty good 2 success with these students coming out of the secondary, going into the workforce, as well as 3 into the post secondary as well. 4 5 REPRESENTATIVE BRIGGS: My light's red, so thank you very much. 6 7 REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: Thank you. 8 I wanted to recognize, we have a 9 couple members that have joined us that are not 10 on this committee, but we wanted to recognize 11 their attendance. That's Representative Tobash 12 and Representative Longietti. Next question will come from 13 14 Representative Helm. 15 REPRESENTATIVE HELM: Thank you, 16 Mr. Chairman. 17 I'd like to follow up on the 18 community college questions. 19 DR. SHANBLATT: There you are. 20 REPRESENTATIVE HELM: Do you have 21 any statistics on what proportion of the students at your colleges are there to receive 22 23 training or a two-year degree that will lead 24 directly to a career as opposed to those who are

looking to transfer to a four-year college or

university? And for those students not looking to transfer but receive a two-year degree, do you have any data on job placement rates for those students?

DR. SHANBLATT: About 60 to 70 percent of our students say they are there to transfer. And about 30 to 40 percent -- it varies a little bit by college -- are there for an occupational degree and to get a job right out of -- when they're finished with their associate's degree or sometimes even certificate.

We don't have good data on that.

It's very difficult for us. We just don't have the resources, honestly, to collect that data.

Schools try. We have fairly low return rates when we try to do that. Our students are -- when they're finished at our colleges, they sometimes -- although they may stay in the county, they may move. They're hard to track for us. And we would like to see Labor and Industry help us track that. We think there are ways that that could be more effective, rather than us trying to chase the student. We could look at how they're -- what they're actually

doing. It's a challenge for us. We'd certainly like to know as well.

We have, certainly, anecdotal information from students who report back to us, but we don't have data across all fourteen colleges.

REPRESENTATIVE HELM: Let's talk a little bit about the career and technical education. I know everybody on the panel would agree that career and technical education is important and the commonwealth needs more skilled workers in the trades. We know there's always a great demand for career and technical school graduates, and our commonwealth businesses have many open positions in these technical areas that can't be filled. However, there seems to be a bias in many of our secondary schools towards sending graduates to a four-year college, university, while trade and technical schools are seen as a lesser path.

And I just -- I think most of you'll agree, but are you coming up with a way to change this? Because, I know -- you know, every year vo-tech kids come to see me, and I'm always so impressed with them and what they know and

how they handle themselves, but yet I know these technical schools don't always hold this same status as a college.

MS. CULLEN: I think that's changing to a degree, I think, as a result of student loan debt perhaps and parents recognizing the opportunities that are available and the salaries available through CTE programs. I also think the business community is helping to change it.

The Pennsylvania Chamber of Business and Industry has been working to promote career and technical education.

But I also think that there needs to be a coordinated effort from the state level. I believe in the House committee report, the 102 committee, there was a recommendation or two on that. So, I believe that much more needs to be done. But I think it is changing to some degree.

This morning, I read an article that quoted two directors from Westmoreland County, and they're seeing a change, that parents are much more open to students going to career and technical education, because they're beginning

to see the options. But I do believe that there's a lot more that needs to be done.

REPRESENTATIVE HELM: I think what you said, I think educating the parents sometimes is good, because sometimes the parents don't want their kids to do it.

So, thank you.

DR. HUDACS: From the secondary perspective, again, getting out to the parents is important. Also, getting the schools to recognize that when they have a college night, which is a traditional way, that career night would be a great way to approach that as well, to incorporate career and technical education.

We point out to the students that
Bloom's taxonomy, which is the level of
learning, in a CTC classroom, you're going to
have more analysis and synthesis than you're
going to have in an advanced placement or
international baccalaureate class. Everything
is applied. Everything is higher level
thinking. Everything is analysis. And as
people start to understand the level of thinking
that's needed and the application of the
information. But that's the level that you need

to talk to people, because they still see it, and it is a struggle that we have, that people realize that there's high-paying jobs, there's high-skilled jobs, and there is no terminal degree, no terminal education that's secondary anymore. Everything is going beyond, even in a technical field.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

DR. GRISCOM: If I could respond to that, Thaddeus Stevens College of Technology. One of the -- that is an issue. And one of the things that we've done for over ten years now, we adopt kindergartens from socioeconomically deprived areas. We have over three hundred students, I forget how many kindergartens right now. And we go out to those kindergartens with our faculty, and we show them what technical careers are about and what the opportunities are. We bring industry in whenever we can. Because they -- we have no -- we spend a lot of money on K-through-12 education. We have no rational career exploration system which says, you know, what are your interests, do you like to work with other people, do you like to work outside, what are your characteristics, and how does that match up with the different career

opportunities. How does a kid growing up in the inner city have any idea what a metal fabricator and welder does, that they build hovercraft in all parts of the world and things like that.

And then we bring those families back for Easter egg hunts and open houses and game days and a number of other things, middle school summer experiences, early enrollment, dual enrollment, and things of that nature.

We're now in the process of -- we will be constructing a community learning center, which will give us a lot more contact with those kids K through 12. But they simply don't understand what those opportunities are, nor do they understand what they have to do to qualify for those opportunities.

In our automotive technology program, if you can't read at grade level 14, you can't read the manuals that are used for the different types of vehicles that are out there. If you can't do college level algebra, you can't work on those cars, because they are pure electronics and computers.

So, we're trying to say, Listen, these opportunities exist at our school, because

we provide what we call the Steven's Grant, 1 2 which is, no matter what financial situation they come from, they can come to us essentially 3 for free, except with the estimated family 4 contribution on the FAFSA form. 5 But we're trying to -- we're trying 6 7 to counter that image that they're getting a 8 subliminal message today. They live in households, in many cases, where the total 9 10 family income is 20,000 dollars a year, and 11 they've got three or four kids in that family. 12 And they're hearing that college costs 30, 40, 50, 60,000 dollar a year. They turn that off. 13 They say, College is not for me. 14 So, we're trying -- I think we have 15 to all, community colleges especially, provide 16 17 that alternative path to higher education by 18 communicating to them that there are other ways 19 and showing them what those opportunities are 20 but also what are the requirements in order to 21 take advantage of those opportunities. 22 REPRESENTATIVE HELM: Thank you for 23 your creativity to change the perception.

Thank you.

REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: Thank you,

24

Representative.

Next will be Representative Schweyer.

REPRESENTATIVE SCHWEYER: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

Over here, folks.

Good afternoon. And I'm going to start with a quick apology, because I should have also asked this question of the PASSHE -- the PASSHE schools when they were here last week.

And trying to ask the question as delicately as I can, because I understand the inherent politics of all of this. There are areas of the commonwealth where it has been widely reported that there looks to be an expansion of community colleges, areas of the state where are underserved by community colleges, yet they have PASSHE schools in their county or an adjacent county.

And I guess, the question I have is, why -- it appears -- I'll say it this way. It appears that there's not a lot of coordination between PASSHE and the community colleges on capital resources, on location of new programs

and those sorts of things. So, avoiding siting any specific area of the state -- not Allentown, to be clear, most importantly not Allentown --are there going -- are there efforts, are there conversations, is there dialogue between the community college systems and PASSHE to have a better coordination of services, expansions, et cetera, et cetera? DR. SHANBLATT: Well, there

certainly is lots of dialogue between the community colleges and the PASSHE universities about a number of different things that we can work on together. I think sometimes offering a program from a community college on a PASSHE campus has some challenges, and I'm probably not the best person to respond to that question.

REPRESENTATIVE SCHWEYER: Duly noted.

DR. SHANBLATT: But, you know, the community colleges have also expanded far beyond fourteen locations. We don't just have fourteen locations. So, we serve lots of, quote, unserved or underserved areas.

We are always willing to look at opportunities to work with PASSHE or any other

educational entity to provide bridges. We see

ourself as the bridge from secondary to

community college, from community college to

four-year. And so, we're more than open to that

idea.

REPRESENTATIVE SCHWEYER: Okay. And I think you -- I think you understand where I'm coming, and, again, I should have had this conversation with PASSHE as well, where I look at the areas of growth, where people are interested, returning students, folks reentering the job market, people changing careers, and just concerned that we are not necessarily meeting those needs in a most cost-effective manner. And even more so, not only in the cost-effective manner, but we're missing other opportunities.

There are areas of the commonwealth who, in the same county, has PASSHE schools and community colleges. There are areas of the state, like I said, where I know there's looking to be expansion of community colleges with PASSHE schools already there. And I just would like to see and hope there would be some sort of more meaningful conversation, understanding that

some of the historical barriers I don't 1 necessarily buy. And so, that's neither here 2 nor there. 3 4 Aside from that, you know, as -representing an area that is -- that has a 5 career and technical institute, Lehigh Career 6 7 and Technical Institute, and an absolutely 8 outstanding community college that I had the opportunity to guest lecture at recently, 9 10 you're -- all of your collective efforts are 11 incredibly important to all of our students. 12 I represent one of the poorest school districts in the commonwealth of 13 Pennsylvania, the Allentown School District. My 14 15 students go to LCCC first and foremost. It is 16 the first place they look, by and large. And so 17 I really appreciate all that you guys do. 18 Thank you. 19 Thank you, Mr. Chairman. 20 REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: Thank you, 21 Representative. 22 Next will be Representative 23 DeLozier. 24 REPRESENTATIVE DELOZIER: Thank you,

25

Mr. Chairman.

I have quick questions, and dealing with the apprenticeship programs. And it's probably aimed more at the community colleges.

And this year in the budget, the governor has proposed a PAsmart initiative dealing with apprenticeships, and I wholeheartedly support the ability to get students involved in apprenticeships. Learning on the job, I think, is an integral part of how they can absorb all the information and use it for their career.

Seven million dollars has been allocated. My first question is, do you see the community colleges -- he has said that all the colleges are going to be able to have a part of this money. Do you see that being disseminated around the fourteen community colleges?

DR. SHANBLATT: Well, thank you for your question. I think the -- I think the word "apprenticeship" means different things to different people. To the community colleges, yes, it does mean a registered apprenticeship, one that's registered with the Department of Labor. It's very structured, has classroom and usually they're 8,000 hours, takes four years to complete.

the workforce sooner.

The community colleges do a lot more what I call hybrid apprenticeships, where they find employers who will employ an individual while they're taking classes. So, it's not a formal registered apprenticeship with the Department of Labor, but in the true spirit of apprenticeship, it very much is. So, it's not — and those are what we find are most successful, oftentimes because they're not as long as a registered apprenticeship. And so individuals can get out and actually get into

PAsmart apprenticeship dollars might fit into what we call the hybrid apprenticeship model.

We'd certainly be open to that. And, certainly, many of our colleges do lots of registered apprenticeships in the traditional areas that they do. We think there are opportunities to do apprenticeships in lots of other areas, for instance, IT.

REPRESENTATIVE DELOZIER: Okay. So, if I understand correctly -- and correct me if I'm wrong -- so basically the community colleges don't have the necessary types of apprenticeship

<b>-</b>	programs in order to receive any of these
2	dollars?
3	DR. SHANBLATT: No. That's not what
4	I said. Many of them do registered some
5	registered apprenticeships, and some do a lot.
6	REPRESENTATIVE DELOZIER: What types
7	of what type of apprenticeships
8	DR. SHANBLATT: So, for instance,
9	Community College of Allegheny County has
LO	carpenters, electricians, iron workers,
L1	plumbers, sheet metals workers all as registered
L2	apprenticeships.
L3	REPRESENTATIVE DELOZIER: Okay.
L 4	DR. SHANBLATT: HACC offers an
15	industrial manufacturing technician
L 6	apprenticeship. I could go through the list.
L7	Delaware has one on welding and machining.
L8	So
L9	REPRESENTATIVE DELOZIER: And these
20	are all at different campuses
21	DR. SHANBLATT: Different some of
22	the colleges do certainly have these.
23	REPRESENTATIVE DELOZIER: Okay. And
24	the dollars, in and of themselves, I don't
25	know how does those dollars do the dollars

1	come through the community or an entity and
2	pay for tuition?
3	DR. SHANBLATT: What dollars?
4	REPRESENTATIVE DELOZIER: These
5	dollars
6	DR. SHANBLATT: That would come?
7	REPRESENTATIVE DELOZIER: Yes.
8	DR. SHANBLATT: Hypothetical
9	dollars.
10	REPRESENTATIVE DELOZIER: Right,
11	right, right, yes.
12	DR. SHANBLATT: It's not clear how
13	to me, anyway maybe someone can help
14	me how the PAsmart dollars would be
15	distributed, if they would be grants that one
16	applies for. We haven't really seen a lot of
17	detail behind it. So, it's not clear to us how
18	that would happen. We'd certainly be welcome to
19	working with that.
20	REPRESENTATIVE DELOZIER: Okay. So
21	there's no at this point in time, the
22	apprenticeship programs that are in place, any
23	dollars that comes through, this is these
24	totally new dollars, but as it exists right now,
25	they how do the dollars work? Do the

1	students pay tuition and then they are accepted
2	into an apprenticeship program, and then they go
3	work at a company?
4	DR. SHANBLATT: Some depends on
5	the nature if it's a registered
6	apprenticeship with, say, the iron workers, with
7	a union, then they get paid for that work that
8	they do while they're in the apprenticeship.
9	REPRESENTATIVE DELOZIER: Okay.
10	DR. SHANBLATT: Okay. So, again,
11	there's lots of different models
12	REPRESENTATIVE DELOZIER: There's
13	moving parts as to how this is going to operate.
14	DR. SHANBLATT: There's lots of
15	different moving parts and pieces. Yes.
16	REPRESENTATIVE DELOZIER: Okay. All
17	right. And you had mentioned that it's shorter.
18	How much shorter? Like rather than a four-year
19	program? How much shorter would it be?
20	DR. SHANBLATT: It could be two
21	years. It could one year. It depends on the
22	nature of what it is.
23	REPRESENTATIVE DELOZIER: And they
24	get certification, is that
25	DR. SHANBLATT: Um-hum, yeah.

REPRESENTATIVE DELOZIER: -- in 1 2 order to then go and work in the field. DR. SHANBLATT: Correct. 3 REPRESENTATIVE DELOZIER: And you 4 had also mentioned something about transfer. 5 So, when someone is doing an apprenticeship 6 7 program, do they do all of that time at a 8 community college, or do they need to also 9 transfer to another possibly four-year school or 10 something like that? Or can it all be done 11 within the community college setting? 12 DR. SHANBLATT: My understanding is 13 that most registered apprenticeships are either done entirely in a union setting or in concert 14 with the community college. 15 16 REPRESENTATIVE DELOZIER: Okav. 17 Okay. 18 DR. SHANBLATT: I don't know of any 19 that are done at four-year schools, but I could 20 be wrong. 21 REPRESENTATIVE DELOZIER: Okay. No. 22 That -- I don't know. That's why I'm asking. 23 And if the program -- so, as you 24 have established at this point, and that will 25 probably come through that program, with the

dollars that are coming, would -- do you 1 2 anticipate starting any more registered apprenticeship programs, or -- I mean, I know 3 4 this is an "if," but I don't know if any 5 dialogue had been happening with the possibility of having more state dollars come into this type 6 7 -- would we see more apprenticeship programs 8 and, therefore, more students served? DR. SHANBLATT: What we would hope 9 10 is that these apprenticeships would be a little 11 more flexible, they would be hybrid model 12 apprenticeships rather than the standard 13 registered apprenticeships that are so common in the building trades now. 14 15 REPRESENTATIVE DELOZIER: Okay. So, 16 bottom line, we need to -- we need to get a lot 17 more details on where this money is going. 18 Okay. Thank you very much for that 19 info. 20 REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: Thank you, 21 Representative. 22 Next will be Representative 23 Krueger-Braneky. 24 REPRESENTATIVE KRUEGER-BRANEKY: 25 folks. Thanks so much for -- over on this side.

Thanks so much for joining us here today. 1 I've got a couple of questions about 2 different populations that are served through 3 4 your system. So, first of all, for the career and 5 technical centers, students who come from school 6 7 districts, I understand that it's a competitive 8 process and that the districts determine 9 criteria. Correct? And that it may be 10 different in one part of the commonwealth than 11 in another part of the commonwealth. 12 MS. CULLEN: Yes. 13 REPRESENTATIVE KRUEGER-BRANEKY: 14 Okay. What percentage of the students who come 15 are coming with an IEP? 16 MS. CULLEN: That varies widely by 17 career and technical schools, but would -- I 18 would guess 25 to 30 percent. REPRESENTATIVE KRUEGER-BRANEKY: 19 25 20 to 30 percent. Okay. 21 MS. CULLEN: The average. REPRESENTATIVE KRUEGER-BRANEKY: 22 Are 23 there -- do you have any sense of whether 24 there's regions in the commonwealth where 25 they're more likely, or is it just pretty

diverse across the board? 1 2 MS. CULLEN: There are areas where it is much higher. 3 4 REPRESENTATIVE KRUEGER-BRANEKY: And 5 I come from southeast Pennsylvania, Delaware County specifically. 6 7 MS. CULLEN: Yes. That might be a 8 higher percentage. REPRESENTATIVE KRUEGER-BRANEKY: 9 10 Okay. And when a student comes to CTC with an 11 IEP, who bears the cost of the IEP, the sending 12 district? Or does the CTC absorb that 13 responsibility? 14 MS. CULLEN: The CTC generally 15 absorbs that responsibility, because special education funding does not follow the student 16 17 from the district to the CTC. REPRESENTATIVE KRUEGER-BRANEKY: 18 19 Okay. 20 MS. CULLEN: Which results in a 21 general higher cost per student for a CTC, which 22 creates a situation where districts are saying, well, cost per student is too high, so they send 23 24 less students, and it just keeps -- the

situation results in reduced -- reduced

enrollments for some -- from some other 1 2 district. REPRESENTATIVE KRUEGER-BRANEKY: And 3 so, what happens when there are more students 4 5 who want to attend than there are spots from that district? 6 7 MS. CULLEN: It depends on what's 8 open. Each -- generally, the districts are part of an articles of agreement that sets the number 9 10 of spots that a district is eligible to send. 11 When a district doesn't send as many as they 12 have agreed to, either other districts send 13 more, or the fact that less district -- less 14 students are coming drives up the cost per 15 student. So, it becomes a self-fulfilling 16 prophecy on increased cost. 17 REPRESENTATIVE KRUEGER-BRANEKY: 18 Okay. 19 DR. HUDACS: I can give you a 20 specific from the Lancaster County. So, we 21 have, for our special ed population, we're about 22

40 percent of our students who are attending. We also have an arrangement with our Intermediate Unit, which provides the special education teachers. And then the billing for

23

24

25

1 that teacher, in our particular case, is billed 2 right back to the districts who are sending. So, the services are provided by a third party, 3 which would be the Intermediate Unit, and then 4 the charge is sent right back the school 5 district, so, in our particular case, our CTC, 6 7 what we will accommodate with the facilities and 8 the instructors that are regular ed instructors. 9 The special ed instructors are coming through 10 the IU. 11 REPRESENTATIVE KRUEGER-BRANEKY:

Okay.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

DR. HUDACS: So, it remains a competitive process. Even with the IEPs, students still have to -- they have to be at a certain level of performance in order to be able to get in, because the spots are competitive. And that mostly comes from the need and the number of spots that are available.

## REPRESENTATIVE KRUEGER-BRANEKY:

Okay. So, what I'm hearing then is the difference, there's some places where the CTC bears the full cost of the IEP, but you're saying, in Lancaster County, some of it gets billed back to the district, through the --

DR. HUDACS: Right. I can only talk 1 to Lancaster County itself, but as Jackie had 2 said, it varies throughout the -- throughout the 3 state. There's different arrangements 4 throughout the -- throughout the different CTCs 5 throughout the state. 6 7 REPRESENTATIVE KRUEGER-BRANEKY: 8 Sure. Okay. And so, some places the burden is 9 10 borne by the district and some places by the 11 CTC, depending on the agreement. 12 MS. CULLEN: In the majority of 13 cases, it would be borne by the CTC. But you 14 have to remember that about, depending on the 15 school, 70 to 85 percent of the funding for the 16 school is provided by the districts. There's a 17 small percentage that comes from federal funds 18 and I think about 5 percent that comes from 19 state funds, the state CTE subsidy. 20 REPRESENTATIVE KRUEGER-BRANEKY: 21 Okay. And then a question for the community 22 college system. 23 I know that the -- you know, there's 24 an expectation for local share and local

investment in these programs, but the actual

25

1	investment varies drastically across the
2	commonwealth. Can you tell us where we're doing
3	best and where we're most challenged in terms of
4	local investment?
5	DR. SHANBLATT: I can't tell you
6	where. I can tell you numbers, if I can find
7	it. I think our local share there's a lot of
8	facts in this book. I will find it.
9	REPRESENTATIVE KRUEGER-BRANEKY: And
10	I know that the light is red, so hopefully the
11	chairman will permit just a brief response.
12	DR. SHANBLATT: Somewhere between, I
13	would say, about 8 and 20 percent of our
14	operating budget comes from our local sponsors
15	and somewhere between 15 and 25 of our one-third
16	from the state comes from the state.
17	REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: And, Doctor,
18	if you want to get a more concise answer and
19	send it to us
20	DR. SHANBLATT: Sure.
21	REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: we'll
22	make sure that the Representative
23	DR. SHANBLATT: I can provide the
24	exact numbers.
25	REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: Thank you.

DR. SHANBLATT: I know that --1 there's a range. It's not the same in every --2 for every school. 3 REPRESENTATIVE KRUEGER-BRANEKY: 4 5 just want to hear -- make sure I heard the last piece correctly, though. You said somewhere 6 7 between 15 and 25 percent of the required 8 one-third comes from the state? So, we've been underinvesting in the community college system? 9 10 DR. SHANBLATT: Yes, ma'am. REPRESENTATIVE KRUEGER-BRANEKY: 11 12 Okay. Thank you. 13 DR. SHANBLATT: It's -- 16.5 is the low. The high is 30.4. The average is 23.1. 14 15 REPRESENTATIVE KRUEGER-BRANEKY: 16 Okay. Thank you. 17 REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: Thank you. 18 Next will be Representative Boback. 19 REPRESENTATIVE BOBACK: Thank you, 20 Mr. Chairman. So, we all understand that 21 Pennsylvania's CTE programs need to be 22 23 responsive to new and emerging business and 24 industry. I think that's been our theme so far. But what does a CTC do when the 25

local industry comes to you and requests support of a new program but that program will exceed the allowable index for an increase to a district's budget? What do you do? How do you accommodate them?

MS. CULLEN: If it's an adult program, the school can immediately accommodate it, working with the industry to provide some funding.

If it's a secondary program, it
needs to be approved by the joint operating
committee of the school, if it's a secondary
program, which is made up of board members of
all the sending school districts. So, it
sometimes does become a problem, because there
are programs that easily cost, the equipment,
200,000 to 500,000. So, it results in increased
budget and increased cost to the districts.

So, it really becomes a budget issue the following year, whether the boards will approve it or not.

REPRESENTATIVE BOBACK: So, in the second instance, then, can a CTC claim exemption under Act 1, like exemptions that are granted to school districts?

MS. CULLEN: No. In fact,

talking -- thinking a little bit about that, as the districts' budgets have become tighter, Act 1 has had an impact, because if the district's budget is tighter, the CTC has no way -- it's not in the legislation for a CTC to claim an Act 1 exemption. So, as -- for instance, the state funding level to CTCs has not increased in eight years, so that means that the district cost has gone up, and there are districts living under Act 1 who do not have the ability to raise taxes. So, it's -- as I said before, it's kind of this spiraling -- spiraling downward resources for the CTC.

REPRESENTATIVE BOBACK: You're such a fine resource, and that -- you know, that's really upsetting, because you want more people to take advantage.

Excuse me, sir. Did you want to comment?

DR. HUDACS: I was just going to say -- you know, and speak specifically, because what Jackie is referring to is a very critical problem. At Lancaster, we're working with sixteen districts, so the Act 1 cap, it's not

only what that cap is as far what our budget is, but also how each of those sixteen districts react to that cap.

If you have some members -
districts don't want to raise their tax at all

or if they want to stay well below the cap, that

limits what we are able to, as a CTC, build

within our budget. So, we have to be reactive

to what the sending districts are, although our

needs could be specifically different.

In your scenario of there's a need for a program, which, as Jackie has said, would be additional equipment, staffing, and so on, we have less flexibility to build a budget to accommodate that in the secondary level than even a school district would, with its limited funding, because at least that's a taxing institution and the CTCs are not.

REPRESENTATIVE BOBACK: Did you ever have an instance where the industry actually comes to you and says that they will develop the program with the equipment, industrial tools needed if you would be able to teach it?

DR. HUDACS: We are -- again, speaking for Lancaster County, we are presently

working with the BB and T Bank, that has put in a matching fund, which our foundation has supported with its funds as well, where we've been able to incorporate an advanced welding and a precision machining shop.

Now, those are primarily on the adult level, which is why we're able to turn that around so quickly. But with the equipment at the adult level, because it's the same facility, we can begin to develop secondary programs that would be able to utilize that equipment.

If we're entirely on the secondary, if we do not have this vibrant adult ed program, we would never be able to turn around that quickly. And to have a manufacturer come forward and say, "We will pay that," you're still dealing, as Jackie had said, with the articles of agreement and how that's going to play in with what the sixteen districts, in our case, would be able to support.

REPRESENTATIVE BOBACK: I see.

MS. CULLEN: And you need to remember that CTCs are bearing some of the same costs and increases, for instance, in retirement

payments that districts are absorbing. But they 1 2 have options through Act 1 and other things. But budgets are tight. 3 Also, none of the money that comes 4 from the state or districts for CTCs is used for 5 the adult programs, only the secondary programs. 6 7 So, adult programs have to be self-supporting 8 and sometimes also a profit, they'll become a 9 profit center, because of the support from 10 business and industry. The equipment, as was 11 said, the equipment that's bought through adult 12 funding then can benefit the secondary students. 13 REPRESENTATIVE BOBACK: Thank you. 14 Thank you, Mr. Chairman. 15 REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: Thank you, 16 Representative. 17 Now Representative Donatucci. 18 REPRESENTATIVE DONATUCCI: Thank 19 you, Mr. Chairman. 20 And thanks to all of you for joining 21 us today. 22 My questions are for President 23 Thaddeus Stevens is educating more 24 students than ever before. You're expanding

your campus along with your programs. Your

25

college has strong relationships with the private sector.

I have four questions that are very much interrelated, so I will ask them, and then you can just take it from there. Thank you.

Okay. So, how do private sector partnerships work? What's required from each side? Which programs have the most demand from employers? Which programs are showing the most growth? And what do you find to be the best way to keep building employer relationships so that you keep them engaged for the long haul?

DR. GRISCOM: Thank you. Let's go to 10,000 feet for just a minute. Okay?

Last year, we had fourteen hundred employer -- over fourteen hundred employers with over three thousand jobs for three hundred graduates. Those jobs started at 40, 50, 60, 70,000 dollars. A number of those graduates will be making over 100,000 dollars in four or five years.

We don't -- we have a 90 percent response rate on our surveys of students and over 60 percent with employers. So, we can verify -- that's not just a sample. That -- in

some cases, that's almost a census of our response. So, that was really great for us, that these students -- we just had a career fair two weeks ago. We had a hundred and forty-six employers, three hundred and eighty representatives, a number of them are graduates; another hundred and eighty that we couldn't fit into three collegiate basketball courts online. Several hundred jobs. Again, 40, 50, 60, 70,000 starting salaries.

So, while that's great for us, that's terrible for the Pennsylvania economy. The only sustainable competitive advantage a company has in a global marketplace is their workforce. They're going to pay the same for utilities or it's going to be comparable for labor, for assemblies, for machining, for transportation, all these types of things.

So, if your workforce is not more productive, more innovative, more creative than the workforces you're competing against, you're going to lose. It's just like basketball or any type of athletic enterprise. If your guys aren't more productive or your gals aren't, you're not going to win. And we're asking our

companies in this commonwealth, and especially in the United States, to play four-on-five basketball. They don't even have a full team.

So, we had -- we supplied four hundred graduates for three thousand jobs. If you do the math, I think there's two hundred thousand skilled jobs in Pennsylvania right now that are unfilled. They don't -- I had a senator ask me, he said, Bill, I hear you say that all the time. Can you prove that?

So, I had my career services person put out an e-mail to our employers, those fourteen hundred base. And within less than twenty-four hours, we had three hundred of them respond. I have the Excel spreadsheet right here. And they're saying, We could work more shifts. We have equipment that's sitting dormant on more than one shift, if we had the skilled employees to fill those jobs.

Again, I'm no mathematician, but two hundred thousand jobs at 50,000 dollars a year, 1600 dollars of state taxes, that's over 3 billion dollars. And this is the Appropriation Committee. How do we fill the gap between revenues and expenses?

1

2

3

4

5 6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

1415

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

To me, that's like a no-brainer. need to provide these companies with the sustainable, competitive workforce they need to compete. They are faced with -- I deal with these folks every day. They are faced with huge numbers of Baby Boomers retiring, let alone the expansion they're trying to do in the economy. So, these are critical needs that they have, and we need to -- to me, that's just commonsense. We -- if the pie's not going to get any larger, then we need to reapportion the pie and take leadership and supply the institutions and organizations that are feeding the companies with the vital skilled employees that they need, whether that be CTCs, community colleges, or

You asked the question how do we -we develop these relationships? We have an
intimate relationship with these companies.
These companies understand the critical role we
play in their vitality and their growth. So,
they develop our curriculums through what we
call DACUMs. They're on our industrial advisory
committees, which, in many cases, meet every
month. They determine the curriculum. They

technical colleges like us.

determine the equipment that we buy. And they employee our students in internships, and they employ them after they graduate.

They fight for these students. They pay for their tuition. They pay for tools, for tee shirts, everything they can do, and provide them with internships so -- and these are internships that are -- these are not minimum-wage internships. These kids make 15, 18, 19,000 -- 19 dollars an hour in the summer, during the year, and prior to their graduation.

We continued that relationship.

I can't read my own writing. What were some of your other questions that you just asked?

progress. Growth. I mean it's just -- we're in this together. I mean, so one of our biggest challenges is 53 percent of our students come from poverty. They're Pell eligible. They're financially disadvantaged. They come from underresourced families. They come with a whole bunch of issues, not just financial disadvantage, but a lot of other resources that many other people have.

So, how do we support that and

provide them with those opportunities? And you know, that's quite a process for us. But when we're successful at it, you know, the results of that are incredible. We break a cycle of poverty. These students go out and they become incredibly successful.

To do that, we have to provide them what we call a Stevens Grant, which provides them with their tuition, their room, their board, their tools, and their books, and they're only responsible for their estimated family contribution. But, at the end of that — and that's an expensive proposition. There's no question about it. But at the end of that, we have a 70 percent graduation rate. We have a progression rate of over 80 percent, and almost 100 percent replacement rate in almost all of our students but with a couple of them. So, that is a process that we use.

And, I think, you know, to me, that's economic development. That's social engineering, or whatever you will, but I think the results of that are pretty incredible.

REPRESENTATIVE DONATUCCI: I do, too.

1 Thank you. 2 DR. GRISCOM: Thank you. REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: Thank you, 3 Representative. 4 And before we transition over to the 5 next questions, quickly, Dr. Griscom, the 6 7 governor's proposed budget is 14.3 million. The 8 request was 15.9. So, it's a 1.6-million-dollar difference. Without that 1.6 million dollars, 9 10 are you going to have to cut back on something? 11 What would additional funding be utilized for? 12 DR. GRISCOM: We're pretty 13 conservative --14 REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: I know that. 15 DR. GRISCOM: -- in our approach to 16 things. We have a higher ratio -- a smaller 17 ratio of administration, faculty -- and staff 18 to our faculty and to our students. There's no president's house. There's no car that's 19 20 designated for any particular member of our 21 staff. I don't have a secretary. We try and --22 we still get things done, and we get them done effectively. 23 24 We've been the Aspen top 10 percent

of two-year colleges in America since the

25

inception of the award, and we're a Simons\*
scholarship nominee this year. But we just try
and be as conservative as we can with our money.

What we would do to try and accommodate that, we would not fill positions, which we're not doing right now. We would not -- we would not increase any programs. We would try and defer as much maintenance as we possibly can in order to make that.

That 1.6 -- last year, we were very fortunate to receive a million-dollar increase, which is about 7 and a half percent, to our state appropriation. We spent 1.2 million dollars more this year in salaries and benefits, for mandated increases in salary and benefits and things of that nature. So, we're kind of treading water.

We have done as many things as we possibly can internally to increase capacity.

We've leased over 50,000 square feet of private sector manufacturing space to improve -- increase programs. We doubled the size of our metal fabrication and welding program. We doubled the masonry program. We've added programs in the evening. We added software

engineering this year. But it is a tightrope that all of us walk in higher education.

But, again, I don't see this -- I see this as an investment. I -- we talked about this as education. I think it's economic development. If we can grow this workforce, if we can provide these great employers that we have in Pennsylvania with the workforce they need, they can grow their revenues by 30 and 40 percent. Every one of our graduates that gets out of there, within a few years, they're living the American dream. They're buying a home. They're taking vacations. They own a car. They're driving the economy.

They're not -- our median student loan debt at Thaddeus Stevens College of Technology is 7,300 dollars. These kids pay this off in the first three months they're working. So, they're buying things. They're consumers. They're driving the economy. they're paying taxes. And the companies that they work for are doing the same thing.

So, to me, this is economic development more than it is just about education.

1 REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: I appreciate 2 And I hate to cut you off, but we have been red for quite a while. 3 Representative Roae. 4 5 REPRESENTATIVE ROAE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. 6 7 My first question is for Thaddeus 8 Stevens. I want to make sure I read the 9 material correctly and I heard you correctly, 10 but when students graduate from your school, 11 there is nearly a 100 percent placement into 12 jobs related to what their program of study was? 13 DR. GRISCOM: That's correct. 14 REPRESENTATIVE ROAE: So, you 15 basically educate kids -- not necessarily 16 kids -- students for jobs that actually exist. 17 DR. GRISCOM: Absolutely. 18 REPRESENTATIVE ROAE: Do you think 19 that's something that other post secondary 20 education institutions in Pennsylvania should 21 consider doing? Because we have a lot of kids graduating from many different taxpayer-funded 22 post secondary education, you know, institution 23

in Pennsylvania where there's not a real high

success rate of students actually getting jobs

24

25

in their field of study.

DR. GRISCOM: There is a mismatch between the output of higher education in Pennsylvania and the United States and the needs of the economy. And one way to fix that is to do what we do. A lot of higher education institutions today, and for the last decade, have been competing for students based on what I call an amenities war: individual rooms, individual bathrooms, kitchens, dining halls, saunas.

I can show you, LSU just dedicated the lazy river, which is a concrete river that runs down, spells LSU, and goes into a fifty- or sixty-seat hot tub at the bottom of it.

Climbing walls, restaurants --

REPRESENTATIVE ROAE: Are those resorts or colleges? What are you describing?

DR. GRISCOM: Well, they're not going on vacations. In my mind, they're going to an education. But these are things that

drive the cost, and you enter into twenty- and thirty- and forty-year bond issues, they're not ways that you can cut back. But they're competing for students based on that.

And what I think that we should do in Pennsylvania is, if you're receiving a direct appropriation or if you're indirectly receiving state funds through PHEAA or even through Pell moneys, then you should be required to inform consumers about the decision that they're about to make. If you're about to spend anywhere between 100 and 200,000 or 300,000 dollars on higher education -- if you were buying a house or anything substantial, you would want to get as much information about it as you possibly could.

so, why don't we -- when students and parents come to me or come to our institution, we tell them, Listen, when you're looking at us and comparing us to other institutions, do it based on our performance. Ask them for the information that's on our website. How many students in the last five years that started this program graduated? How many got jobs in their field? What was their median starting salary? What was their median student loan debt? What was the graduate satisfaction with the programs? What was the employer satisfaction with the graduate? And

where were those graduates five years after they graduated? And based on that, make an intelligent decision.

If you do that, you're not going to sign up for a criminal justice program that has 10 percent graduation rate or whatever at 9 dollars an hour with no benefits. You're not going to make that same decision. So, why don't we inform consumers or the general public about the performance of our programs. It seems to me that's just the kind of thing ethically that we should be doing. But we don't do it.

REPRESENTATIVE ROAE: Yeah, yeah. Seems like it would make sense.

And as policy makers, we should probably do a better job of tying some type of performance measures. Our basic model is, we basically give schools money every year. We should be looking at graduation rates. We should be looking at what percent of the students get jobs in their field of study. And we should be looking at things like that and maybe have some kind of an incentive system, where schools that do better in those measures get more money. Those schools that are failing

in those measures, they would get less money.

DR. GRISCOM: It's not about post secondary, one-year programs, two-year programs, four-year programs, graduate, or post graduate. It's not about that. We need graduates in all those programs. We need them in business, in health care, in engineering, industrial -- but it needs to be tied to the performance of the program. And for that to work, it can't be based on some voluntary survey that a college does.

As I told you, we get a 90-plus percent return on our graduate response rate. If we're going to take the first 10 percent that comes in and report that, it's going to look really, really good. Okay. It's not going to look like our average starting salary is 40,000 dollars. It's going to look like it's 70 or 80 or 90,000 dollars. So, it has to be apples-to-apples comparisons. But if we take the time to do that, then I think it would be an effective means of doing it.

It doesn't work the way we're doing it right now. If you look at what used to be the president's scorecard or the United States

1	Department of Education scorecard, it will tell
2	you that the average cost of attendance at
3	Harvard University is like 19,000 dollars a
4	year. That's ridiculous. That's based on a
5	statistic that they're using of the
6	clearinghouse that has financially disadvantaged
7	students that report that information.
8	Harvard's own website says it's 65,000 dollars a
9	year.
10	So, for the scorecard to have the
11	effect that you want or for the performance
12	measures to have, they have to be
13	apples-to-apples comparison, at least 70 percent
14	response rate.
15	REPRESENTATIVE ROAE: Well, thank
16	you for your testimony. I appreciate it.
17	DR. GRISCOM: Thank you.
18	REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: Thank you,
19	Representative.
20	Next will be Representative Kim.
21	REPRESENTATIVE KIM: Good afternoon.
22	My question to you is for each
23	panelist. I was wondering how much do you pay
24	in remedial courses, professors who have to
25	teach remedial courses so that they can pretty

much start at par at your schools? And if you could talk to high school administrators, what would you ask them to do to better prepare the students to your institutions?

Thank you.

 $$\operatorname{DR.}$  SHANBLATT: I guess I'll start with that one.

I don't have an exact number on what we would pay our faculty. I -- we could get that to you. Students who are taking developmental courses do pay tuition, so we try to make it even, if you will. In other words, we're not losing, their -- we're not making -- we're neither losing money nor making money on that proposition. Okay.

However, we have made some good strides recently in some changes to how we approach development education at many of our institutions, and we're finding great success.

I think many students are actually better prepared than their results on one test might show. And so, we're looking at what we call wholistic placement as our institutions. So, we look at their high school GPA, which actually tells you a lot more than their SAT score. And

it tells you if they -- and we're placing them into college-level courses based on that and have found that they are doing extraordinarily well, whether they would have placed into that college-level course with the ACCUPLACER test, which is what many colleges use to place students.

We're also doing co-requisite work, so that if a student has just a little bit deficiency in english, they take a college english course and a booster course alongside it. So, we have lots of different ways to help students get there.

That being said, I think, honestly, the biggest challenge is in mathematics, not in english and reading. And I think that's -- and this is -- this is a personal opinion here. I'm not speaking on behalf of the commission or even my own institution. I think a lot of that is cultural. It's the "I can't do math, math is hard, what do we need math for" philosophy.

You don't all need the same math.

And so, most of us -- most of our institutions have created different math pathways for different majors. So, if you're going to be a

psychology major, you don't need to take calculus, so would I put you on the path for calculus. You need statistics. And so, if we can make that determination early enough, we put you on the statistics pathway, rather than the college algebra, calculus pathway. If you're in a STEM career, you obvious are going to need college algebra and calculus.

So, it's trying to help students understand where they are, where their strengths are, but also, from an early age, we can all do sixth grade math, which is about what most of us use in our daily lives. And that's the -- we can build on that. We can learn more. It depends on what we want to do. But we can't be afraid of math. And so many people are.

And it's become very culturally ingrained. Sorry. This is a passion of mine.

But, at any rate, we really need to help students understand that they are math capable from a young age. And that leads all the way through their entire lives. It doesn't mean you have to do calculus, it doesn't mean you have to be an electrical engineer, but just be proficient enough to do sort of normal math

that you need to do in your daily life.

So, go ahead.

DR. GRISCOM: I will respond to your question.

So, the question was how do we place the adjuncts and so forth. We are on the PSEA contract, so our people -- we have a standard pay scale, based on your education and experience. And we place them based on that.

So, our adjuncts are placed on the same scale as our full-time faculty member. Obviously, the difference is the benefits that go with being a full-time employee versus a part-time employee.

DR. HUDACS: On the secondary level, we provide some ESL and some academic support.

But, by and large, because of the competitive nature in getting into the CTC, a lot of supports are offered from the home school.

We do have our NOCTI. We have 73 percent students who are passing and at the advanced level. So, the students are going through. At the adult level, we do have the ACCUPLACER. If they do not succeed the first time through, they're given a self-directed study guide for retesting. And then, if that

doesn't work at that point, we do run a remediation course to give them a third opportunity. But if they don't pass the ACCUPLACER to come in, then they're not into the adult ed program either.

REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: Thank you.

Next will be Representative Heffley.

REPRESENTATIVE HEFFLEY: Thank you,

Mr. Chairman.

And I want to thank all the testifiers here today. This has been great.

with the line of questioning earlier, I just want to commend the schools. I represent CCTI, which has been one of the highest testing technical schools and the collaboration that they do with a lot of the employers in the area to find those jobs. I mean, kids coming out of high school and going right to work in a machine shop. And the -- so I'd like to just touch on, like, the co-op agreements between, you know, kids going a half a day to classes and half a day, you know, in high school, almost in an apprenticeship-type program. I think that's great.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25 end to

One of the things that you had said earlier was that the students that are coming into the technical schools with IEPs. We have a wonderful program throughout our region, the Shine After School program. And one of the things when I talk to the instructors and the folks that run that, they say a lot of times they'll have young students that are struggling in the classroom. But when they get in the programs and it's more hand-on learning, they excel. And a lot -- and sometimes those students that excel in the classroom don't necessarily excel. So, basing that all kids learn different, and we base this IEP model on a set type of learning, isn't it better for those students to go into -- a lot of these students that maybe have an IEP because they just learn in a different way to go into more of a hands-on-based learning system like in a technical school? If you could --

DR. HUDACS: The short answer to your question is yes. But that also applies to kids that are at risk or disengaged with the traditional school. That's that carrot at the end to get.

program. We do have a half-day junior program to give the students some exposures to the wide range of a particular cluster of occupations and then go into the senior. So, yeah, we have found it to be a saving grace for a number of students that that's where they excel. That's a great equalizer, is that they don't have to worry about how well they comprehend the

In our case, we're a senior-only

academic piece. As I said before, the analysis, the synthesis, the application, those higher level thinking skills, they're absolutely the things that need to apply.

So, the thinking aspect is there.

It's the area or the arena in which they can exhibit it differs. And that is a great opportunity for them.

REPRESENTATIVE HEFFLEY: And so often I hear from the employers in our region about, you know, they're having a hard time finding the qualified workforce that they need, especially as the Baby Boomers start to retire. So, I want to commend the technical schools and the technical programs on getting people into that — into the workforce and into that, as

well as the community colleges. I think they also play a role in that.

So, I just want to commend
everything you do. And certainly looking at
budgets and trying to help what you're doing to
get these folks into the workforce with good,
family-sustaining jobs that provide benefits.
And I think that's what we're all about.

Thank you.

DR. GRISCOM: When you talk about learning styles, I think that we see the students do learn different ways. John Dewey, an old educational psychologist in my time, said, "Learn by doing." And that's a fundamental principle that everything that we do at our college is based on.

that you retain the information longer, if you actually have engagement with the materials, if it's hands-on. I think that's the reason the United States is forty-seventh in the world in terms of STEM education. We went from 40 percent of all the scientists and engineers in the world living in the United States to 15 percent, because we have moved away from

hands-on type of learning.

So, I think you can learn those higher level synthesis, evaluation, critical thinking skills. It's just, if you have a learning style -- I was that type of learner. I grew up on a farm. I think you learn better by doing. So, I see students who don't excel in the traditional lecture type of mode, where you just hear information, to those who actually learn by doing. And I think that's why CTCs, community colleges, and programs like ours are so successful. And I think, as a nation, we would be a lot more successful.

and I see trends of that in the STEM education that's being proposed for K-through-12 education, to get people back into -- human beings are naturally inquisitive, curious. They use their tools and materials to try and control their environment. And we take that away from them and we put them in classrooms where they sit in little chairs and tables and lines and so forth, and all we do is talk to them, they don't learn as effectively. Some people do. They're conceptual, abstract learners, but for the majority of people, I think we learn better by

being engaged in the content. 1 2 So, I think that's the reason you see this success in CTCs and some of these other 3 4 places, because we're actually accommodating what is the natural human characteristic. So, I 5 think that helps with them. 6 7 REPRESENTATIVE HEFFLEY: Thank you. 8 REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: Thank you, 9 Representative. 10 Next will be Representative Quinn. 11 REPRESENTATIVE QUINN: Thanks, 12 Mr. Vice Chairman. Thank you all for being here. It's 13 really a very interesting panel. 14 15 And, Dr. Shanblatt, it's terrific 16 that you came out here. It's nice to see you 17 and your level of expertise speaking on behalf 18 of the other community colleges for the state. I'm going to direct my first 19 20 question to you. And if this was said earlier, 21 excuse the head cold. I'm missing a little bit 22 here. The average debt coming out of the 23 24 community college, can you speak to that? DR. SHANBLATT: I don't know 25

statewide the number, but I could get it for 1 2 you. I can tell you that our average tuition is 3 around 4,000 dollars a year. So, debt proportionately for a two-year degree will be 4 5 not very high. REPRESENTATIVE QUINN: Thanks. And 6 7 you certainly give right there in Bucks, like 8 the other ones, a terrific value for the dollar.

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I was pleased to learn recently that one of my nieces will be joining you in September. Yeah.

I was asked this recently, and I'm wondering if you've ever heard statistics on the amount of student debt that's acquired for courses they never completed, meaning they get the loan and then they drop the course. Is that's something that's studied that you're aware of?

DR. SHANBLATT: I think if we dug deep enough, we could find numbers on it. Those students do exist. We try to minimize them, obviously.

REPRESENTATIVE OUINN: Um-hum.

DR. SHANBLATT: As an open-access institution that accepts every student that applies, we do get some that are perhaps less

1	serious about their studies than others. But we
2	try to even help those students get through.
3	But occasionally it does happened.
4	And it can happen for a variety of
5	reasons. It could happen for a medical reason
6	or a family crisis reason. So, it's not always
7	just that they're not finishing because they
8	don't feel like it.
9	REPRESENTATIVE QUINN: True. But
10	the interest rate is still there, and it's still
11	something
12	DR. SHANBLATT: Absolutely.
13	REPRESENTATIVE QUINN: that's
14	just going to build on them.
15	DR. SHANBLATT: Yes. But we work
16	very hard to minimize student's debt.
17	REPRESENTATIVE QUINN: When I hear
18	about the other career and technical education,
19	it reminds me of programs that I've seen right
20	in Middle Bucks or Upper Bucks vo-tech that many
21	of them marry right into your community college,
22	and they're having dual enrollment programs.
23	DR. SHANBLATT: Um-hum.
24	REPRESENTATIVE QUINN: Is that a
25	common model? Because that, to me, when I see

that, that's just so cool, when a kid gets out,

A, with a certificate or skills, and also with

college degrees. And how is that paid for?

DR. SHANBLATT: The -- well, I can tell you, the college portion of that high school dual enrollment is paid for either -- typically by the student. We use EITC dollars to help cover the costs of that or some scholarships that we might have. It's a little tricky with scholarships because technically they're high school students. So, we've tried to be creative in how we do that. It's a challenge, I will tell you. We'd like to do more of it.

We have programs with the three career and technical education schools in Bucks County where we go in and teach some college courses in the high school. They get credit for some of the technical work they've done, if they pass their NOCTI exam, which was mentioned earlier.

So, we do have great pathways that allow them to continue on to the community college, often with thirty credits at least.

But it's tricky to figure out how to pay for it,

I will tell you, because of the limited or lack of funds for dual enrollment right now.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

And I don't know if you have other thoughts on that.

MS. CULLEN: The CTCs statewide have -- first of all, there are statewide articulation agreements that -- between CTCs, community colleges, and other post secondary institutions that, using the statewide model and a certain score on the NOCTI exam, they have nine advanced college credits, transcripted credits, for the technical program. But there are programs and relationships between CTCs and post secondary where students are getting, for their technical program at the secondary level, thirty college credits. And then there are several models where it's a -- they get thirty, so it only takes one year to an associate degree, and if they choose to go on to a four-year degree, so it saves them lots of money and also helps them move more quickly to the workplace.

## REPRESENTATIVE QUINN:

Dr. Shanblatt, I recall a number of years ago being on campus -- this was prior to your

time -- and hearing from a number of 1 2 representatives of the community college the frustration that the credits were not easily 3 4 taken at -- be it PASSHE schools or state relateds. Could you speak to that? What's that 5 situation? How's that evolved? 6 7 DR. SHANBLATT: I think the 8 situation has improved significantly. We were talking a little earlier about that. I think 9 10 there's probably still some work that we could 11 do particularly with the PASSHE schools. It's 12 much better. 13 The privates are very anxious for 14 our students --15 REPRESENTATIVE QUINN: I understand. 16 DR. SHANBLATT: -- so they make it 17 pretty easy for our students to transfer. 18 I think there's a bit of a -certainly there is a desire for the 19 20 PASSHE schools to take our students. They want 21 transfer students, everyone does. And -- so, 22 there's lots of competition for them. We want to make sure that all 23 24 college courses transfer, not necessarily as

general credit but as real courses towards their

25

	<b> </b>
1	major. And, by and large, it works fine. You
2	know, occasionally, there's a little hiccup.
3	But, by and large, things are pretty smooth.
4	REPRESENTATIVE QUINN: Thank you.
5	I see my light's George, are you
6	going to give me any leeway?
7	REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: No, I am
8	not.
9	Representative James.
10	REPRESENTATIVE JAMES: Thank you
11	twice, Mr. Chairman.
12	Panel, you're wonderful advocates.
13	You're wonderful advocates for your various
14	schools. And I appreciate your coming today. I
15	told my wife what I was doing, and she was
16	cheering you on as well from western
17	Pennsylvania.
18	I'd like to ask you kind of a
19	general question for anyone or everyone on the
20	panel to come with me to the land of the
21	improbable in which your ideas to improve your
22	system are possible without worrying about
23	money.
24	So, what would you advise this group
	1

today, the Commonwealth, actually, to do to make

your system better?

DR. HUDACS: I'll start. One thing, on the secondary level, one issue that isn't even monetary appropriation-wise is the certification requirements for teachers coming into the field need to be addressed. There -- you have people who are making very good salaries as skilled technicians in their field and then to come into the classroom, it's a reduction in pay to begin with. But then you're adding a rather onerous responsibility of picking up -- is it eighty credits?

MS. CULLEN: Seventy-eight.

MR. HUDACS: Seventy-eight credits that you're required to take. And you're even required at what school you have to take them. And you have a very limited time in which to do that.

So when you are able to get good people in the field, there's some obstacles that they have to go through to be able to stay there. And that can be addressed.

Financially, always there's that opportunity.

But even if you look at it

realistically, beyond taking the -- the pink-shaded glasses off and looking at it realistically, if there were things that can be done to work with business and industry as partnerships with the CTCs, whether it be with the secondary students or even as the adult ed, something that would, even if it was matching, for whatever they would throw in for the cost of the equipment, the cost of the development of programing, for the cost of staffing, even if it was matching from the state, that would be huge.

The cost of equipment is so high for any new program, and I know that there is a competitive equipment grant, but anything that could be done along those lines would be tremendously helpful as well.

MS. CULLEN: I would agree with his comments, especially on the certification issue.

On the other issue, for funding, as I've said, we've not received an increase in eight years. So, that has driven up the cost to local districts. So, anything that could be done, either to change the basic ed funding formula to include an incentive for CTC enrollment or to increase the funding line

for -- the CTE funding line on equipment.

eight years, the amount of money available for competitive grants has decreased. Schools used to be able to apply for a 100,000-dollar grant with a 100,000-dollar match. That's now down to a 50,000-dollar grant. And it's a competitive process, which I always feel is good for those that have and not so good for those that have not. There may be schools that can afford grant writers or have many administrators, and then there are schools where there's one administrator in the building and they're competing against other schools.

REPRESENTATIVE JAMES: Remember, panel, money is no object in this fantasy world.

MS. CULLEN: Oh, if money is no object, I could be here all day.

 $\label{eq:REPRESENTATIVE JAMES: This is our} % \end{substitute} % \e$ 

MS. CULLEN: Two things that have happened in the last three years that have been positive that could be built upon is the supplemental equipment grant, which the legislature started. It was 3 million a year.

Last year it went down to, I think, 2.3 or in that range. That is a grant that's -- it's a very simple application process. It's driven out by formula. So, everybody gets a piece of the pie.

So, raising the CTE line, raising that supplemental equipment line would be very helpful, because we are an equipment-intensive system. And you have to keep up with the latest equipment if you're going to keep up with business and industry.

Another possibility would be a dedicated tax credit program. Our business and industries really help us. We have over ten thousand businesses represented on our occupational advisory committees. It would be wonderful if there was a dedicated line for CTCs that we could go out to industry in the same way that you do in an EITC program and help industries help us. It would cost the taxpayers money, but, in the long range, it would probably save taxpayers money.

The other thing that I think has been very helpful in the last few years is Act

6. We have great hopes for that program, which

1	allows CTE students to show other ways of
2	accomplishment and for high school graduation.
3	That would be very that we are hoping that
4	is very helpful as we move forward.
5	So, those are a few of my dreams.
6	If you do them all, then I can retire.
7	REPRESENTATIVE JAMES: Thank you
8	much.
9	REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: Thank you,
10	Representative.
11	Next and that was interesting. A
12	budget hearing where you can just tell whatever
13	you want, just money's no object. I swear I
14	heard you say that. Kind of scary.
15	Representative Santora.
16	REPRESENTATIVE SANTORA: I agree.
17	On my subject, money should be no object either,
18	but it is.
19	This past year, I helped a
20	constituent with her son to get into community
21	college. He has autism, and he had to take
22	certain tests to be placed, and the placement
23	tests didn't suit his learning ability.
24	However, he's a very highly intelligent young
25	man, needed to continue his education. And he

ultimately, through the help of some of the folks at Delaware County Community College who were willing to look outside the box, we were able to get him in.

But the overall attitude was,

"That's how we always did it." And in

learning -- I love to see your heads shaking

like that, because we can't do it the way we've always done it.

What are we doing to address this group of students that are coming in with autism, who need to be part of the workforce, be able to live on their own and have the ability, quite frankly, to live on their own, and give them the opportunity for higher education?

DR. SHANBLATT: If I could speak to that one first, maybe. We are -- we, at Bucks, just started the Achieve program, which is for students with autism, provide some wraparound services. Some four-year universities have this program already.

REPRESENTATIVE SANTORA: Yes. And I'm aware -- I'm aware of Bucks, because that was the example we gave.

DR. SHANBLATT: Yeah. And so, we

hope it will expand to other colleges. I spoke
earlier about how we look at wholistic placement
and not just the placement test to decide
whether a student is college ready or not. So,
there are multiple ways that we can provide
additional services.

I will tell you, they are not -it's -- one of the challenges for community
colleges is the cost. Sometimes students with
autism need services to get acclimated to the
environment, to kind of learn where they're
going, learn the social cues, just how it all
works. And -- and there is cost associated with
that. That takes staff.

And we've -- we received a grant to get this program off the ground. We will have to institutionalize it, that is, pay for it ourselves afterward. And so, we're trying to figure out how we make that happen. But it's a challenge, because once a student gets to post secondary, there's no sort of special ed funds or the IEP doesn't follow them or, you know -- as you probably know from working with this constituent.

REPRESENTATIVE SANTORA: Yes.

DR. SHANBLATT: It's a hard, bright

line. And so we understand that this is a population of students that we need to serve and we want to serve, and we are trying to figure out how best to do it. So, thank you for that.

REPRESENTATIVE SANTORA: So, I have a question on that. And let me -- I'll come back to that question. But are we reaching down into the secondary and making sure that the transitioning is happening properly? Because I feel that's a big hiccup in itself.

DR. SHANBLATT: We do, whenever possible. In fact, sometimes our counselors are invited to the students' and parents' final IEP meeting in spring of their senior year. Some schools invite us. Some schools say "no thank you." I mean, there's sort of a little bit of variation there. We would like to be there.

We would like the student and their parent to come and talk about us as soon as they decide to attend, not at the last minute. It's always harder to figure things out and to figure out services at the last minute. So, we hope that students and their parents will plan this, to give us enough time. But we do have services

in place to help students, and we'd like to be there on the front end.

REPRESENTATIVE SANTORA: Great. On that, and from a cost standpoint, I understand. And everything -- unfortunately, there's a dollar amount that gets attached to it. It's unfortunate that that's what has to happen, and -- especially when we're talking about students with IEPs, autism. And I understand the IEPs don't follow, however, should we be transitioning some of these students to 504s that do follow?

DR. SHANBLATT: If it makes sense for the student, yes. I just want to be careful. I'm not an expert in this, and so I wouldn't want to say that that's appropriate in every situation.

understand. But we can document a 504 the same way we can document an IEP and make sure those services are being done. And I understand there'll be a cost associated with it to the next level of education, because then you've got to follow the procedures -- or the documentation of the 504.

1	DR. SHANBLATT: Right. It's just
2	like if a student with a disability presents, we
3	have to provide whatever accommodation that
4	student needs, right? I mean, it's the same
5	thing. And we do. And that's at our cost.
6	REPRESENTATIVE SANTORA: Understand.
7	DR. SHANBLATT: So, we do it.
8	REPRESENTATIVE SANTORA: Well, I'm
9	glad to see what you're doing at Bucks.
10	DR. SHANBLATT: We're trying.
11	REPRESENTATIVE SANTORA: We've got
12	to really expand that everywhere we can. It's
13	just so important.
14	At the end of the day, there will be
15	a cost savings
16	DR. SHANBLATT: Yes.
17	REPRESENTATIVE SANTORA: where
18	these students are then going to go into the
19	workplace and be able to provide for themselves,
20	taking away from other financial burdens, and
21	then maybe that can be redirected to the
22	education side of things.
23	DR. SHANBLATT: That would be nice.
24	REPRESENTATIVE SANTORA: So, thank
25	you.

DR. SHANBLATT: Thank you. 1 2 REPRESENTATIVE DUNBAR: Thank you, 3 Representative. 4 And with that, that will bring an 5 end to our hearing. I wanted to thank you all for not only being here today but for the work 6 7 that you do in challenging paradigms and the stereotypes of traditional secondary and post 8 secondary education. I think the efforts you're 9 10 doing are really, truly developing a workforce 11 for the future, and we appreciate that. 12 So, with that, we are adjourned. And we'll be back at 3 o'clock for the Department 13 14 of Agriculture. 15 (Whereupon, the hearing concluded at 16 2:34 p.m.) 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25

## REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE I HEREBY CERTIFY that the foregoing is a true and accurate transcript, to the best of my ability, produced from audio on the said proceedings. BRENDA J. PARDUN, RPR Court Reporter Notary Public